

CONTENTS

Udānavarga I—tr. Sara (Boin) Webb	1
Two Buddhas in Conversation—Guido Auster	5
Pali Buddhist Studies in Japan—Kiyoshi Ota and Masataka Ikeda			7
Nimitta: The Beginning and the End—Caroline Sherwood	...		34
The Significance of the Brahmavihāras in Theravāda Buddhism— Arvind Sharma	37
Nietzsche and Buddhism—Russell Webb	41
News & Notes	47
Obituaries	49
Book Reviews	53

The *Pali Buddhist Review* appears twice a year as the organ of the Pāli Buddhist Union.

Annual Subscription : £3.00, U.S. \$7.00 or equivalent currencies payable to "Pali Buddhist Union" (Giro No. 33 483 4007)

Editor : Russell Webb

Editorial Address : 15 Stedham Chambers,
Coptic St,
London WC1A 1NL
England

PALI BUDDHIST REVIEW

Vol. 6, No. 1

1981-2

UDANAVARGA

This didactic compilation, which bears a close affinity to the Dhammapada, is attributed to the Sarvāstivādin ācārya, Dharmatrāta (the uncle of Vasumitra who presided over the Buddhist Council held in Kashmir during the reign of Kaniṣka, 2nd century A.C.). The Sanskrit text was subsequently lost until the beginning of this century when Aurel Stein, Paul Pelliot and Albert Grünwedel discovered fragments buried in the sands of Central Asia. These were first identified by Richard Pischel (SPAW 1908) who transcribed the Yugavarga (chapter 29) and eventually, based upon the fullest collection lodged in Berlin, Franz Bernhard reconstructed and edited the entire text in 33 *vargas* (2 vols., Göttingen 1965/68).

Specimens brought back to Paris were examined by Sylvain Lévi (JA 1910) who also deciphered and edited fragments of the Tocharian recension of this text discovered on the site of Kuchā (JA 1911). These, together with fragments from the Udānastotra, Udānālankāra and Karmavibhaṅga, were later edited and translated by him under the title *Fragments de textes koutchéens* (Paris 1933). Emil Sieg and Wilhelm Siegling performed a similar service and produced an extensive study of the Tocharian Commentary, Udānālankāra (2 vols., Göttingen 1949/53).

Chapters 1-3 and 5-21 from the (incomplete) collection of Sanskrit fragments deposited in the Bibliothèque Nationale, Paris, were edited and translated into French by N. P. Chakravarti (the then Director General of Archaeology, India) in 1930 for the series Mission Pelliot en Asie centrale. Under the title, *L'Udānavarga sanskrit*, it can still be obtained from the publishers, Paul Geuthner, Paris. Chapter 4, Apramā-davarga, was edited, translated and made the subject of a thorough comparative study by Lévi (JA 1912). The first English translation by Sara (Boin) Webb is here presented in serial form.

The Mūlasarvāstivādin recension, translated into Tibetan in the 9th century by Vidyāprabhākara, was edited from the Kanjur by Hermann Beckh (Berlin 1911). W. W. Rockhill translated it into English (London 1883; repr. Taipei 1972) and included the (Tanjur) Commentary, Udānavargavivaraṇa, composed by another Sarvāstivādin ācārya, Prajñāvarman.

There are no less than four versions of the original text in Chinese. One, the Fa Chū P'i Yü, was translated from the Dharmapada Avadāna-sūtra by Fa-li and Fa-chü c. 300 A.C., and contains 39 *vargas* the last of which equates with the Mahāmaṅgala Sutta (Sutta-Nipāta II 4).

Samuel Beal provided an English prose rendering from the Chinese text (London 1878; repr. Varanasi 1971). Another Chinese text, the Fa Chi Yao Sung Ching, was translated from the Dharmasamgraha-mahārthagāthāsūtra by an Indian monk (known only by his Chinese name, T'ien-hsi-tsai) in 985. In common with the Sanskrit Udānavarga it comprises 33 chapters and is closely related to the Tibetan recension. Charles Willemsen edited the text and supplied an annotated English translation under the title *The Chinese Udānavarga* (MCB XIX, Brussels 1978).

Finally, the reader's attention is drawn to P. K. Mukherjee's excellent paper on "The Dhammapada and the Udānavarga" (*Indian Historical Quarterly*, Calcutta 1935) which remains the clearest and most comprehensive survey on this subject. The author, in addition, provided a translation of the Anityavarga from the Chinese.

Editor

Chapter I

ANITYAVARGA—Impermanence

(Vv 1-14 missing)

15. . . . thus men's lives go and do not return.

16?

17. Just as the herdsman leads cows to pasture with the help of his staff. . .

18. The days and nights pass away. . . Men's lives (diminish) like the water in small brooks.

19. . . . (long is the distance) of a yojana for him who is tired; long is the round of rebirth for the fool ignorant of the Good Law.

20. "I have sons, I have wealth", thinking thus the fool brings about his loss. In himself there is no self. Whence come the sons? Whence the wealth?

21. Hundreds and thousands of men and women who attain(?) the blisses fall under the power of death.

22. All accumulations end in ruin; all elevations in fall; unions end in separation, life ends in death.

23. All beings will die; death is the end of life. It is in accordance with their actions that they will go, gathering the fruit of their merit and fault.

24. Wrongdoers to hell, men of merit to heaven. But the others, who would have meditated on the (good) path in this world, will go to Nirvāṇa, freed from impurities.

25. Neither in the air, nor in mid-ocean, nor in the depths of the mountains is there a place on earth where you can abide without death seizing you.

26. Men, who have existed or who will exist, will all pass away, casting off their bodies. The loss is complete; the wise man who knows this should, steadfast in the Law, live a perfect life.

27. At the sight of an old man, at the sight of a sick man, at the sight of a dead man abandoned by consciousness, the wise man renounced the bonds of family. For the worldling, desires are not easy to avoid

28. They wear out, the royal chariots with brilliant medleys of colour; in the same way, the body falls under the blow of old age. But the Law of virtuous men does not fall under the blow of old age: this is because virtuous men teach it to virtuous men.
29. Shame on you, coarse old age which causes ugliness, since a face that was so lovely has been dishonoured by you!
30. Even living for a hundred years, one is subject to death; old age follows it. . . death.
31. The old(?) go ceaselessly, day and night tormented, burnt by an extreme(?) torment like fish, prey to the suffering of birth and death.
32. Day and night, the life of the moving man, as also the immobile man, like the currents of rivers, go on without stopping.
33. Men who, night and day having passed, see their diminished life, are like fish in shallow water: what pleasure can they find there?
34. This old form is an extremely fragile nest of diseases; rotting, it will undoubtedly give way: life has death as its end.
35. Soon, alas, this body will lie dying on the ground, empty, without consciousness, like a piece of wood that has been thrown away.
36. What good is this body which slips away, ever corrupt, always overwhelmed by disease, defenceless before old age and death?
37. With this impure, diseased and fragile body, you attain the supreme calm, and supreme happiness.
38. "It is here that I will spend the season of rains, winter and summer". The fool reasons thus; he does not see the obstacle.
39. That man, intoxicated by his children and his cattle, has an "attached" mind, death will carry him off, as a flood will a sleeping village.
40. It is not sons who will save you, nor father, nor even kinsmen; for the man vanquished by death, there is no saviour.
41. "I must perform this action; once this is done, that is to be done". Thus is the mortal occupied; old age and death crush him.
42. Therefore, O bhikkhus, who ceaselessly delight in meditation, concentrated, diligent, who see the end of birth and death, having triumphed over Māra and his hordes, may you cross (the river) of birth and (of) death.

TWO BUDDHAS IN CONVERSATION

Guido Auster

In the Musée Guimet of Paris, one can see a beautiful Chinese gilt bronze (Northern Wei Dynasty, dated 518) showing two Buddhas sitting side by side in conversation with each other. This, of course, is the artistic representation of the well-known episode from the famous Saddharma-puṇḍarīka-sūtra of the Mahāyāna.

Now, in Buddhaghosa's commentary on the 20th *sutta* of the Digha-nikāya (Sumaṅgalavilāsinī II 683f) we find the description of a somewhat similar episode.

A huge congregation of gods has assembled to listen to the Buddha's teaching. The Buddha considers question and answer to be the most suitable way to explain his teaching to this assembly. However, he does not believe any of the assembled gods to be able to formulate the right question, because they are standing on very different planes of mental development. He also doubts whether it would serve the purpose, if he himself would put forward the question and answer it himself. He also finds that none of the present bhikkhus, not even the foremost pupils, would be able to formulate the question in the correct way. Nor would even a Paccekabuddha be able to do it. Only a Buddha like himself would be the right person for this task.

"Is there anywhere another Buddha?" To answer this question he extends his knowledge over endless worlds, but does not see one. This passage is rather puzzling since according to an established theory the world system cannot support two Buddhas at the same time. A theory which is, as is stated a little further in the same text, quite well known to the noble gods (*Ariyā-devatā*) as distinct from the ordinary gods (*puṭhujjana-devatā*): *Ekissā loka-dhātuyā dve Buddhā nāma n'atthi*.

Now, the Buddha decides to create a Phantom Buddha: *Tasmā Nimmita-Buddham māpeṣāmi*.

He does it from his meditation-power and the Phantom Buddha appears with such a splendour that the assembled gods first think that the moon has risen, then the sun, then Mahābrahmā, or another Buddha. He appears, and, without paying homage to the genuine Buddha, sits on a 'created' seat. A description follows of the wonderful six-coloured rays issuing from the bodies of 'both' Buddhas. Then, the Phantom Buddha opens the question by speaking a *gāthā* which is identical with the opening stanza of the Sammā-paribbājaniya Sutta of the Suttanipāta (359).

As can be expected, detailed mention of this incident is made also in the commentary on the Suttanipāta: *Nimittabuddhena hi puṭṭho Bhagavā idaṃ suttaṃ abhāsi*. (Paramatthajotikā II 352, and 360 f). The ancient

commentary Niddesa does not deal with this part of the Suttanipāṭa. In the *ṭīkā* (II 302) on the Sumaṅgalavilāsinī the Nimittabuddho is also mentioned.

The 'second' Buddha in the episode of the Saddharmapuṇḍarikasūtra (chapter XI) is called Prabhūtaratna. He, also, is not a 'genuine' one in the sense of actually living at the time when Śākyamuni makes him appear, seated in a wonderful *stūpa*. It is stated in the *sūtra* that Prabhūtaratna had long ago passed away into the final Nirvāṇa. By the power of Śākyamuni, in accordance with an old resolution of his own, he is drawn to the assembly formed by various sorts of beings, including a multitude of gods.

In both cases the task of the mystical or magical Buddha is to assist the genuine Buddha: in the Pali commentary to put forward the question, in the Sanskrit Mahāyāna text to witness the importance of the Saddharmapuṇḍarikasūtra, and to applaud Śākyamuni.

The artist who made the beautiful bronze, now in the Musée Guimet, depicts the two Buddhas as if in an actual conversation, as can be seen from the position of their hands.

This parallel episode in the Pali and Sanskrit tradition of two Buddhas 'in conversation', is, I think, quite interesting.

Editor: This episode is mentioned on p 206 of *The Image of the Buddha* (ed. David Snellgrove, UNESCO 1978) whilst the image is portrayed on p. 213. For portrayals of double-headed Buddhas, see S. Gaulier, R. Jera-Bezard and M. Maillard *Buddhism in Afghanistan and Central Asia I* (Leiden 1976, pp. 24-5) and C. Bhattacharya *Art of Central Asia* (Delhi 1977, p. 50).

PALI BUDDHIST STUDIES IN JAPAN

Kiyoshi Ota and Masataka Ikeda

1. PĀLI BUDDHIST STUDIES AT JAPANESE UNIVERSITIES

Japanese students begin studying the Pāli language not at Buddhist temples but at universities and colleges. Although most of the universities and colleges that offer Pāli courses are private Buddhist institutions, several national universities also provide courses in Pāli language, Pāli literature or Buddhism. Kyoto, Nagoya, Tohoku, and Hokkaido University, for example, as the tables show, offer Pāli grammar classes or lectures on Pāli literature.

Each main Buddhist sect in Japan has its own college or university. Hanazono University, for instance, is supported by the Rinzai sect, and Otāni University is managed by the Otāni sect of Shin-shū. These universities not only teach the doctrine of their own sect but also courses in the Sanskrit and Pāli languages as well as introductory courses on Buddhism, its history, and so on.

At the Buddhist universities, Buddhist studies may be conducted either in a separate department or incorporated in the department of literature. Komazawa University in Tokyo has departments of law, industrial administration, literature, and Buddhist studies. Taishō University in Tokyo comprises departments of literature and of Buddhist studies. On the other hand, Ryukoku University in Kyoto has departments of law, industrial administration, economics, and literature. Buddhist studies there are conducted by scholars and students in the Buddhist studies branch of the department of literature. Otāni, Hanazono, and Bukkyō University in Kyoto also include Buddhist studies in the departments of literature.

At the national universities, Pāli language or literature, or Pāli Buddhism, is usually taught as a branch of an Oriental philosophy (as, for example, at Tohoku and Kanazawa Universities) or as a branch of Sanskrit literature (as at Kyoto University), both in the department of literature.

Japan thus differs greatly from the Buddhist countries of South East Asia, where Pāli is taught in Buddhist monasteries. Regrettably, most Buddhist priests in Japan have no knowledge of the Pāli language, and thus do not teach Pāli at their monasteries.

Japan offers little opportunity for men who have left university to continue their study of Pāli language and Pāli Buddhism; the advancement of Pāli Buddhist studies is left to the few scholars and young researchers at the universities. The number of students of the Pāli language is not precisely known, although at most there are between about five and fifteen students taking Pāli language as a special subject at each Buddhist university.

I. LECTURES (on Theravāda/Early Buddhism)

University	Subject	Professor	Dept.	Course	Attendance*
Aichigakuin	The Formation of Āgama	Egaku MAEDA	Lit.	Buddhist Studies, History of Buddhism	Graduate
Otāni	A Survey of Āgama	Hajime SAKURABE	Lit.	Buddhist Studies	Both
Otāni	The Doctrines of Early Buddhism	Issai FUNAHASHI	Lit.	Buddhist Studies	Undergraduate
Otāni	Studies on Vinaya	Kyogo SASAKI	Lit.	Buddhist Studies	Both
Komazawa	Early Buddhism	Ichiro KATAYAMA	Buddhist Studies	Buddhist & Zen Buddhist Studies	Undergraduate
Tōyō	Patipatti Studies in Abhidhamma Buddhism	Shoji MORI	Lit.	Indian Philosophy	Undergraduate
Bukkyō	The Doctrines of Southern Buddhism	Mitsuo SATO	Lit.	Buddhist Studies	Graduate
Hanazono	Studies on Early Buddhism	Masayoshi TAKASAKI	Lit.	Buddhist Studies	Undergraduate
Ryukoku	Sociology of Theravāda Buddhism	Yoneo ISHII	Lit.	Buddhist Studies & Sociology	Both
Osaka Univ. of Foreign Studies	Studies on Theravāda Buddhism	Kyogo SASAKI		Thai, Vietnamese & Burmese languages	Undergraduate

* Courses are open to either graduate students only, undergraduate students only, or both.

II. READING AND TRANSLATION (Pāli Canon)

University	Subject	Text	Sub-text	Schedule*	Professor	Dept.; Course	Attendance
Otāni	Reading some versions of Dhammapada	Dhammapada	Udānavarga & Chinese Translation	Chap. 1 10	Hajime SAKURABE	Lit.; Buddhist Studies	Undergrad.
Kyoto	Anthologies of Pāli & Prakṛit	Vasudevahiṇḍi	R. Pischel: Grammatic, Seth: Pāṣaddaṇṇeva		Yutaka OJIHARA	Lit.; Sanskrit Lit.	Graduate
Komazawa	Reading Pāli texts	Jāṭaka Nidānakathā			Keiki HIGASHIMOTO	Buddhist Studies; Bu. & Zen Bu. St.	Undergrad.
Komazawa	Special reading class of Pāli Canon	Pāṭimokkha			Ichiro KATAYAMA	Buddhist Studies; Bu. & Zen Bu. St.	Undergrad.
Tokyo	On Causality (Paṭiccasamup-pāda)	Visuddhi-magga Chap. 17		20 pp.	Kyosho HAYASHIMA	Lit.; Indian Philosophy	Graduate
Nagoya	Reading Pāli texts	Therīgāthā			Egaku MAEDA	Lit.	Undergrad.
Bukkyō	Buddhist studies; Reading original texts	Dhammapada	G. Sasaki & S. Nonome; An Elementary Pāli Gr.	200 stan-zas	Takao KAGAWA	Lit.; Buddhist Studies	Graduate
Bukkyō	Buddhist studies; Reading original texts	Milindapañha		30 pp.	Takao KAGAWA	Lit.; Buddhist Studies	Undergrad.

*The teaching schedule for the year; the number of pages refers to PTS texts. Abbrev.: Gr.—Grammar, Bu.—Buddhist, St.—Studies, Undergrad.—Undergraduate

III. SEMINARS (on Pāli Canon)

University	Text	Reference book	Schedule	Professor	Dept.: Course	Attendance
Aichigakuin	Therīgāthā			Egaku MAEDA	Lit.; Studies of Religion	Graduate
Otāni	Sammohavinodani	Other versions of the text	20-30 pp.	Genjun SASAKI	Lit.; Buddhist Studies	Graduate
Otāni	Samyutta Nikāya (Sagāthā-vagga)		25 pp.	Hajime SAKURABE	Lit.; Buddhist Studies	Undergrad.
Otāni	Visuddhimagga	English translations	15 pp.	Genjun SASAKI	Lit.; Buddhist Studies	Undergrad.
Komazawa	Sahasavathu-ppakaraṇa	Rasavāhini		Ichiro KATUYAMA	Buddhist Studies	Undergrad.
Kyushu	Samyutta Nikāya	K. Mizuno: A Pāli Buddhist Reader		Shoren IHARA	Lit.; Indian Philosophy	Undergrad.
Kyoto	Sutta-Nipāta	W. Geiger: Pāli Literatur und Sprache		Noritoshi ARAMAKI	Lit.; Lit.	Both
Koyasan	Dīgha Nikāya (Brahmajāla Sutta)	The commentary	40 pp.	Shingen TAKAGI	Lit.; Buddhist Studies	Undergrad.
Koyasan	Mahāvagga	Chinese versions of other Vinayas	30 pp.	Ryujun FUJIMURA	Lit.; Buddhist Studies	Undergrad.
Koyasan	Paramatthadīpani	Therīgāthā	30 pp.	Shingen TAKAGI	Lit.; Buddhist Studies	Graduate
Hokkaido	Majjhima Nikāya (121, 122)	Chinese & Tibetan versions		Kotatsu FUJITA	Lit.; Oriental Philosophy	Both
Rishō	Sutta-Nipāta			Enshu KURUMIYA	Buddhist Studies	Undergrad.

IV. PĀLI LANGUAGE (Grammar)

University	Text I	Text II	Dept. giving a class	Professor	Teaching method
Aichigakuin	D. Andersen: A Pāli Reader		Lit.; Studies of Religion course	Egaku MAEDA	Gr. & Lecture
Osaka Univ. of Foreign Studies	Dīgha Nikāya (Mahāpadāna Sutta)		Hindi & Pakistan Language course	Kiyoaki OKUDA	Gr. & Reading
Otāni	G. Sasaki & S. Nonome: An Elementary Pāli Grammar	A. K. Warder: Introduction to Pāli	Lit.	Nobuyuki YOSHIMOTO	Gr.
Kanazawa	M. Mayrhofer: Handbuch des Pāli	D. Andersen: A Pāli Reader	Law & Lit.; Philosophy course	Kiyoshi YOROI	Gr. for 3 months & Reading
Koyasan	K. Mizuno: Pāli Grammar	A. K. Warder: Introduction to Pāli	Lit.	Ryujun FUJIMURA	Gr. for 4 months & Reading
Komazawa	K. Higashimoto: Elementary Gr. of the Pāli Language	Z. Yoneyama: Jātaka Reader	Buddhist Studies	Keiki HIGASHIMOTO	Gr. for the beginners
Komazawa	D. Andersen: A Pāli Reader		Buddhist Studies	Keiki HIGASHIMOTO	Gr. for the advanced
Komazawa	A. P. Buddhadatta: Aids to Pāli Conversation		Buddhist Studies	Keiki HIGASHIMOTO	Seminar
Shitenjo Women's	K. Mizuno: Pāli Grammar	Jātaka	Lit.; the course of Buddhist St.	Kiyoaki OKUDA	Gr. for 3 weeks & Reading
Taishō	K. Mizuno: Pāli Grammar		Buddhist Studies	Ryujun SATO	Gr.
Tohoku	J. Takakusu: A Pāli Chrestomathy	M. Nagai: Pāli Grammar	Lit.	Hirofumi ISODA	Gr. & Reading
Tōyō	Sasa Jātaka	Vinaya (Mahāvagga)	Lit.; Indian Philosophy course	Shoji MORI	Gr. for 4 weeks & Reading
Nihon	K. Mizuno: Pāli Grammar	K. Mizuno: A Pāli Buddhist Reader	Science	Toshio SHIMADA	Gr. & Seminar
Hokkaido	K. Mizuno: Pāli Grammar		Lit.	Kotatsu FUJITA	Gr. & Reading
Rishō	A. P. Buddhadatta: The New Pāli Course		Buddhist Studies	Shinsuke OIKAWA	Gr. for the beginners
Waseda	K. Mizuno: Pāli Grammar	P. V. Bapat: Sutta-Nipāta	Lit.	Akira HIRAKAWA	Gr. & Reading
Ryukoku	K. Mizuno: Pāli Grammar	P. V. Bapat: Sutta-Nipāta	Lit.	Meiji YAMADA	Gr. for 4 month & Reading

The tables that passed were compiled from responses to a questionnaire sent to over forty universities and colleges belonging to the Japanese Association of Indian and Buddhist Studies, and show details of most, if not all, Pāli courses offered at Japanese universities and colleges in 1979. Since the exchange of information between universities in Japan has hitherto been sporadic, this report, intended for foreign readers, may also be useful for Japanese concerned with Pāli studies.

The Pali Canon is customarily read in Japan in available Chinese versions of the Pāli texts. Although identification of a Chinese translation of the Pali Canon is difficult, there exist some useful comparative studies of Pāli Nikāyas and the Chinese Āgamas. *The Comparative Catalogue of Chinese Āgamas and Pāli Nikāyas* edited by Chizen Akanuma in 1929, for instance, serves as a desk companion for every Pāli researcher. Accordingly, we have not included the names of corresponding Chinese versions or of English translations with the Pāli texts in the tables.

The tables cover only the regular classes run by the universities. In addition, there are groups of students reading Pāli texts under the guidance of their professors. At Komazawa University, some of the more earnest graduate students are reading *Atthasālinī* under the instruction of Prof. Kōgen Mizuno, while at Otāni University some of the graduate students are reading *Samantapāsādikā* and *Dhammapada* under the direction of Prof. Hajime Sakurabe. Also not listed in the tables are courses on the history of Indian Buddhism and lectures on Buddhism that have no connection with Pāli or Theravāda.

Outside the university campuses, notable achievements have been made by the *International Buddhist Association* at Kamoeji Temple in Hamamatsu. This association publishes an annual academic bulletin, "Buddhist Studies", principally carrying studies on early and Pāli Buddhism, and has held Pāli seminars over ten times since 1968. These proved very helpful for students to practise reading the Pāli texts and to improve their translating ability. The seminars also provided the students valuable opportunities to exchange information about their university activities and to make friends.

Another group of students of the Pāli language is the *Ogurido Buddhist Studios Assembly*, which has been mainly directed by postgraduate students of Komazawa University. This group used to gather twice a year at the Ogurido Buddhist shrine for a week during the spring and summer vacations to read the Pāli texts with the help of senior students, but recently the assembly has met only once a year. Burmese Sayadaw Ven. U Wepulla, who is staying at the World Peace Pagoda monastery in Kitakyushu city in Japan, has attended all these Pāli seminars and assemblies, giving profitable advice on learning the Pāli language and Theravāda Buddhism.

Lastly, a new movement involving the top Pāli scholars in Japan is *The Society for the Study of Pāli and Buddhist Civilization*, organized following

a proposal in late 1976 by Egaku Maeda, Professor of Aichigakuin University, by whom it has since been directed. Since the first meeting of the Society on 5th April 1977, regular meetings have been held twice yearly in Nagoya. The Society not only provides a forum for papers on Pāli Buddhism but also promotes the exchange of recent information on the present situation and historical development of Buddhist civilization, through, for example, the investigation of new text books, records in Pāli and the folk beliefs prevailing in Buddhist countries.

The leading members of the society are Kōgen Mizuno, Vice-President of Komazawa University, Shōzen Kumoi, Professor of Otāni University, and many other high-ranking Japanese scholars of Pāli, including some scholars of the social sciences and anthropology: Yoneo Ishii, Professor of the Center for Southeast Asian Studies, Kyoto University; Tamotsu Aoki, Professor of Osaka University, and others. They are breaking new ground in both cultural and Buddhist studies of the Pāli language in Japan.

2. JAPANESE TRANSLATIONS OF PALI TĪPĪTAKA

A Japanese translation of the Pali Tīpīṭaka in 65 volumes containing 70 books and entitled *Nanden Daizō Kyō* (The Great Baskets of Canon of the Southern Tradition) was published over the six years from 1935 to 1941. This great work is a monumental achievement which is the pride of the Pāli academia in Japan, and is unlikely to be surpassed in future.

The work was undertaken to commemorate Dr Junjirō TAKAKUSU's distinguished contribution to Buddhist studies, and it was decided that all of his students should participate in the translation. Some of the translators, however, were not entirely conversant with the Pāli language, and this gave rise to certain problems from a strictly academic point of view. There is, for instance, inconsistency in translation throughout the series, and too heavy a reliance on Chinese terminology. There is, however, an invaluable general index to the series, *Nanden Daizō Kyō Sō-sakuin* edited by Kōgen MIZUNO.

In recent years, translation works have tended to be undertaken more systematically. Based on many years of Pāli studies in Japan, the Pāli texts are recompiled according to the translator's research interest into, for example, scriptures belonging to the doctrine section, the Vinaya rule section, or the biography of the Buddha section. This system naturally produces a consistency of terminology.

When Pāli texts were first translated into Japanese, translators largely borrowed terminology from the Chinese Canon, or, if there was no equivalent Chinese term, they applied the Chinese word for a closely similar conception or created a neologism of Chinese characters. Since the Second World War, however, Dr Hajime NAKAMURA (b. 1912) and other scholars have been trying to avoid such difficult Chinese words and use modern colloquial Japanese. Their positive translations are being read and also finding acceptance in academia.

The main stream of Pāli learning in Japan today follows two broad channels: field surveys in Pāli Buddhist countries based on the methods of social science, and philological studies of Abhidhamma texts in the light of the Visuddhimagga. In the latter case, researchers are tackling such newly published texts as Upāsakajanālaṅkāra and Thūpavaṃsa, probably prompted by the progress in studies of the northern Abhidhamma.

Apart from these academic translations, more familiar stanzas of, for example, the Dhammapada and Sutta-Nipāta are being translated as a part of an educational movement for a general readership. Some of these translations are highly literary. Many of the compilations of Buddhist scriptures published recently contain brief translations of Pāli texts on the fundamental doctrines.

The following is a list of Japanese translations of Pāli scripture published up to September 1979. The list is in the order followed in *Nanden Daizō Kyō* and is the same as that in PTS except for the Vinaya Piṭaka.

In addition to the translations listed, the Mahāparinibbāna Sutta was translated into Japanese by Dr Hajime NAKAMURA and published as *Buddha Saigo no Tabi* (The Last Journey of the Buddha) by Iwanami Shoten (Tokyo 1980) and the Sāsanavaṃsa was translated by Mr Zenno IKUNO as *Biruma Jōzabu Bukkyō Shi* (History of Theravāda Buddhism in Burma) published by Sankibō Busshorin (Tokyo 1980).

3. RESEARCH WORKS ON PALI BUDDHISM

Buddhist studies in Japan based on Pāli materials were begun in the early 20th century by Fumio NANJO, Junjirō TAKAKUSU (1866-1945), and others who had learned the modern critical method of Buddhist studies in the West. Today, it appears, however, that the work begun by them has almost been completed.

Kōgen MIZUNO (b. 1901) has examined the fruits of the Pāli academia in the West and grouped activities there into the following seven categories.

1. Collation and publication of original Pāli texts.
2. Translation of the Pali Canon.
3. Study of the doctrines and history of Pāli Buddhism.
4. Historical study of the establishment of the Pali Tipiṭaka.
5. Publication of Pāli dictionaries, grammars, and textbooks; and philological study of the Pāli language.
6. Bibliographic study of Pāli materials.
7. Religious movements based on Pāli Buddhism.

A List of Japanese Translations of Pali Tipiṭaka
VINAYA PIṬAKA

No.	Title	Year of Publication	Publisher	Translator	Section Translated
1	Nanden Daizō Kyō/The Great Baskets of Canon of the Southern Tradition Vol. 1	1936	Taishō Shinshū Daizō Kyō Kankōkai	Tenzui UEDA	Vin III
2	" / " Vol. 2	1938	"	"	Vin IV
3	" / " Vol. 3	"	"	Shōkō WATANABE	Vin I
4	" / " Vol. 4	1939	"	Shōson MIYAMOTO Shōko WATANABE	Vin II
5	" / " Vol. 5	1940	"	Tenzui UEDA	Vin V
6	Kokuyaku Daizō Kyō/The Great Baskets of Canon translated into the National Language: Ronbu 14	1920	Kokumin Bunko Kankōkai	Shundō TACHIBANA	Vin I, II
7	Bukkyō Seiten Sen 1; Syoki Kyōten/Selected Buddhist Scriptures Vol. 1; The Early Scriptures	1974	Yomiuri Newspaper Co.	Yutaka IWAMOTO	Vin I, pp. 1-44; II, pp. 184-200; III, pp. 11-21
8	Pa-Kan-Wa Taiyaku KAIRITSU NO KONPON/Pāli, Chinese, & Japanese Translations of Bhikkhu Pātimokkha	1929	Heigo Pub. Co.	Makoto NAGAI	Bhikkhu Pātimokkha

SUTTA PĪṬAKA

No.	Title	Year of Publication	Publisher	Translator	Section Translated
1	Nanden Daizō Kyō/The Great Baskets of Canon of the Southern Tradition: Vol. 6	1935	Taishō Shinshū Daizō Kyō Kankōkai	Hakuju UI & others	D 1-14
2	" / " Vol. 7	"	"	Shūichi TERASAKI & others	D 15-23
3	" / " Vol. 8	1936	"	Gishō NAKANO & others	D 24-24
4	Sekai Koten Bungaku Zenshū 6, Butten 1/The World Classic Literature Series Vol. 6, Buddhist Canon 1	1966	Chikuma Shobō	Hajime NAKAMURA	D 16
5	Sekai no Meicho 1, Baramon Kyōten; Genshi Butten/Great Books of the World Vol. 1, Brahmanic Scriptures & Early Buddhist Canon	1969	Chūōkōron Sha	Gajin NAGAO	D 2
6	Bukkyō Seiten Sen 1, Shoki Kyōten/Selected Buddhist Scriptures Vol. 1, Early Canon	1974	Yomiuri Newspaper Co.	Yutaka IWAMOTO	D 13, 31, 15
7	Nanden Daizō Kyō/The Great Baskets of Canon of the Southern Tradition: Vol. 9	1935	Taishō Shinshū Daizō Kyō Kankōkai	Ryūshō HIGATA	1-40
8	" / " Vol. 10	1936	"	"	M 41-76
9	" / " Vol. 11-1	1938	"	Keisai AOHARA	M 77-110
10	" / " Vol. 11-2	1936	"	Baiyū WATANABE	M 111-152
11	Chū-Agon/Majjhima Nikāya: Vol. 1, 2	1934	Hajinkaku Shobō	Gohō HAYASHI	M 1-152

SUTTA PĪṬAKA

No.	Title	Year of Publication	Publisher	Translator	Section Translated
12	Sekai no Meicho 1, Baramon Kyōten; Genshi Butten/Great Books of the World Vol. 1, Brahmanic Scriptures & Early Buddhist Canon	1969	Chūōkōron Sha	Gajin NAGAO Hajime SAKURABE Shigeki KUDO	M 28, 63, 86, 93, 115
13	Nanden Daizō Kyō/The Great Baskets of Canon of the Southern Tradition: Vol. 12	1937	Taishō Shinshū Daizō Kyō Kankōkai	Chizen AKANUMA	S 1-11
14	" / " Vol. 13	1936	"	Gohō HAYASHI	S 12-21
15	" / " Vol. 14	1939	"	Shōkō WATANABE	S 22-34
16	" / " Vol. 15	1940	"	Shundō TACHIBANA	S 35-41
17	" / " Vol. 16-1	"	"	Shundō TACHIBANA Shōkō WATANABE	S 42-47
18	" / " Vol. 16-2	"	"	Shōkō WATANABE	S 48-56
19	Zō-Agon/Saṃyutta Nikāya Vol. 1, 2, 3	1934	"	Chizen AKANUMA	S 1-56
20	Sekai no Meicho 1, Baramon Kyōten; Genshi Butten/Great Books of the World Vol. 1, Brahmanic Scriptures & Early Buddhist Canon	1969	Chūōkōron Sha	Gajin NAGAO Hajime SAKURABE Shigeki KUDO	S 6-1-1, 56-11, 1 2-10, 3-3-1, 7-2-1, 8-5, 22-87, 35-200
21	Agon Kyōten / Agama Canon Vol. 1	1979	Chikuma Shobō	Fumio MASUTANI	S 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 20, 21 (But some are abridged)
22	" / " Vol. 2	"	"	"	S 23, 23 (") 24-2, 27-1, 33-1
23	" / " Vol. 3	"	"	"	S 35, 36, 38, 42, 44, 45, 46, 47, 48, 51, 55, 56 (")

24	" / " Vol. 4	"	"	"	"	S 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11 (")
25	Nanden Daizō Kyō/The Great Baskets of Canon of the Southern Tradition: Vol. 17	1935	Taishō Shinshū Daizō Kyō Kankōkai	"	Unrai WOGIHARA	A 1, 2, 3
26	" / " Vol. 18	1936	"	"	"	A 4
27	" / " Vol. 19	1937	"	"	"	A 5
28	" / " Vol. 20	"	"	"	Unrai WOGIHARA Katsuya TSUCHIDA	A 6, 7
29	" / " Vol. 21	1939	"	"	Shōkō WATANABE	A 8
30	" / " Vol. 22-1	1940	"	"	"	A 9
31	" / " Vol. 22-2	"	"	"	"	A 10, 11
32	" / " Vol. 23	1937	"	"	Ryōdō MIYATA & other three	Khp, Dhṛp, Ud, It
33	" / " Vol. 24	1939	"	"	Kōgen MIZUNO Ryōdō MIYATA	Sn, Vv
34	" / " Vol. 25	1936	"	"	Reihō MASUNAGA	Pv, Thag, Thig
35	" / " Vol. 26	1937	"	"	Osamu TAKADA	Ap 1-39
36	" / " Vol. 27	1940	"	"	Ryōjun YAMAZAKI	Ap 40-55
37	" / " Vol. 28	1935	"	"	Shundō TACHIBANA & other four	J 1-50
38	" / " Vol. 29	"	"	"	Kōkaku KURIHARA & other five	J 51-150
39	" / " Vol. 30	"	"	"	Shundō TACHIBANA & other three	J 151-250

40	" / " Vol. 31	1935	"	"	Shundō TACHIBANA & other five	J 251-350
41	" / " Vol. 32	1936	"	"	Shundō TACHIBANA & other two	J 351-416
42	" / " Vol. 33	1938	"	"	Baiyū WATANABE & other four	J 417-463
43	" / " Vol. 34	1936	"	"	Osamu TAKADA & other two	J 464-496
44	" / " Vol. 35	1938	"	"	Osamu TAKADA & other three	J 497-520
45	" / " Vol. 36	1937	"	"	Shundō TACHIBANA Osamu TAKADA	J 521-532
46	" / " Vol. 37	"	"	"	Osamu TAKADA	J 533-539
47	" / " Vol. 38	1938	"	"	"	J 540-545
48	" / " Vol. 39	1939	"	"	Tokuo MARUYAMA Osamu TAKADA	J 546-547
49	" / " Vol. 40	1935	"	"	Shōkō WATANABE	Pis 1, II pp. 1-91
50	" / " Vol. 41	1936	"	"	"	Pis II pp. 91-243, Bv, Cp
51	" / " Vol. 42	1939	"	"	Kōgen MIZUNO	MNd 1-10
52	" / " Vol. 43	"	"	"	"	MNd 11-16
53	" / " Vol. 44	1940	"	"	"	CNd
54	Hokku Kyō/Dhammapada	1935	Iwanami Shoten	"	Unrai WOGIHARA	Dhp

SUTTA PĪṬAKA

No.	Title	Year of Publication	Publisher	Translator	Section Translated
55	Danmapada/Dhammapada	1948	Gendō Sha	Makoto NAGAI	Dhp
56	Danmapada/Dhammapada	1961	Shiri Undō Honbu	Entai TOMOMATSU	Dhp (Eng.* & Chin. translations also included)
57	Budda no Shinri no Kotoba, Kankyō no Kotoba/The Buddha's Words of Truth and Inspiration	1978	Iwanami Shoten	Hajime NAKAMURA	Dhp, Udānavarga
58	Shakamuni Seikun Shū/The Sacred Teachings of Sakyamuni	1935	Daitō Shuppan Co.	Unrai WOGIHARA	Sn
59	Budda no Kotoba/Words of the Buddha	1958	Iwanami Shoten	Hajime NAKAMURA	Sn
60	Kokuyaku Daizō Kyō/The Great Baskets of Canon translated into the National Language: Kyōbu 12	1918	Kokumin Bunko Kankōkai	Shundō TACHIBANA	Dhp, Thag, Thig
61	" / " Kyōbu 13	"	"	"	Sn, Cp
62	Sekai Koten Bungaku Zenshū 6, Butten 1/The World Classic Literature Series Vol 6, Buddhist Canon 1	1966	Chikuma Shobō	Kyōshō HAYASHIMA	Thag, Thig

* by Nārada

ABHIDHAMMA PĪṬAKA

1	Nanden Daizō Kyō/The Great Baskets of Canon of the Southern Tradition; Vol. 45	1938	Taishō Shinshū Daizō Kyō Kankōkai	Ryōchi SATO	Dhs
2	" / " Vol. 46	1937	"	Mitsuo SATO	Vibh 1-15
3	" / " Vol. 47	1940	"	Mitsuo SATO & other two	Vibh 16-18, Dhk, DhkA, Pp
4	" / " Vol. 48-1	1936	"	Shōkō WATANABE	Y 1-6
5	" / " Vol. 48-2	1937	"	"	Y 7
6	" / " Vol. 49	1938	"	"	Y 8-10
7	" / " Vol. 50	1936	"	Ryōjun YAMAZAKI	P Tika 1, PA
8	" / " Vol. 51	1937	"	"	P Tika 2-8, PA
9	" / " Vol. 52	"	"	"	P Tika 9-22, PA
10	" / " Vol. 53	1938	"	"	P Duka
11	" / " Vol. 54	"	"	"	P Duka 55-100, PA
12	" / " Vol. 55	"	"	"	P Duka-tika, Tika-duka
13	" / " Vol. 56	1939	"	"	P Tika-tika, PA
14	" / " Vol. 57	"	"	Mitsuo SATO Ryōchi SATO	KV 1-5
15	" / " Vol. 58	"	"	Ryōchi SATO	KV 6-23, KvA
16	Hō-jū/Dhammasaṅgaṇi	1933	Hajinkaku Shobō	Chizen AKANUMA Kinsaku OSHIMA	Dhs
17	Fumbetsu Ron/Vibhaṅg		"	Chizen AKANUMA	Vibh

No.	Title	Year of Publication	Publisher	Translator	Section Translated
18	Ron-Ji/Kathāvatthu: Vol. 1	1932	"	Gohō HAYASHI	KV
19	Ron-Ji/Kathāvatthu: Vol. 2	1933	"	"	KV
20	Ron-Ji, Fu Kakuon Chū/Kathāvatthu, with Buddhaghosa's Commentary	1932	Daitō Shuppan Sha	Mitsuo SATO Ryōchi SATO	KV, KvA
21	Bukkyō Shinrigaku no Kenkyū/A Study of Buddhist Psychology	1960	Nihon Gakujutsu Shinkō Kai	Genjun SASAKI	DhsA
22	Nanpō Shoden Butten no Kenkyū/A Study of the Buddhist Canon of the Southern Tradition	1936	Kokusho Kankōkai	Makoto NAGAI	VA (Samantapāsādikā) Introduction

THE OTHER PĪṬAKA

1	Nanden Daizō Kyō/The Great Baskets of Canon of the Southern Tradition: Vol. 59-1	1939	Taishō Shinshū Daizō Kyō Kankōkai	Saishun KANAMORI	Mil 1-4
2	" / " Vol. 59-2	1940	"	"	Mil 5-9
3	" / " Vol. 60	1939	"	Tomoji HIRAMATSU Shundō TACHIBANA	Dv, Mv
4	" / " Vol. 61	1940	"	Tarō HIGASHIMOTO	Cv
5	" / " Vol. 62	1937	"	Kōgen MIZUNO	VM 1-7
6	" / " Vol. 63	1938	"	"	VM 8-13
7	" / " Vol. 64	1940	"	"	VM 14-23
8	" / " Vol. 65	1941	"	Makoto NAGAI Kōgen MIZUNO Hakuju UI	VA Introduction Abhidhammatthasāṅgaha Dhamma-lipi

9	Kokuyaku Daizō Kyō/The Great Baskets of Canon translated into the National language: Kyōbu 12	1918	Kokumin Bunko Kankōkai	Sōgen YAMAGAMI	Mil
10	Mirinda O no Toi/The Questions of King Milinda: Vol. 1	1963	Heibon Sha	Hajime NAKAMURA Kyōsyō HAYASHIMA	Mil
11	" / " Vol. 2	1964	"	"	"
12	" / " Vol. 3	"	"	"	"
13	Sekai no Meicho 1, Baramon Kyōten; Genshi Butten/Great Books of the World Vol. 1, Brahmanic Scriptures & Early Buddhist Canon	1969	Chūōkōron Sha	Yutaka OJIHARA	Mil pp. 25-28, 40-41, 46-48 (PTS)
14	Tō-Shi/Dīpavaṃsa	1933	Hajinkaku Shobō	Gohō HAYASHI Tomoji HIRAMATSU	Dv
15	Dai-Shi/Mahāvamsa	1932	"	Gohō HAYASHI	Mv
16	Shōjō Dō Ron: Jō/Visuddhimagga Vol. 1	1936	Tōyō Bunko	Hisatsugu ISHIGURO	VM 1-11
17	Bukkyō Kenkyū/Buddhist Studies Vol.4 (Journal of Internat. Buddhist Assoc.)	1974	Kokusai Bukkyōto Kyōkai (Hamamatsu)	Ichirō KATAYAMA	Gandhavaṃsa
18	" / " Vol. 7	1978	"	"	Subodhāṅkara (I)

THE OTHER BUDDHIST CANONS

1	Gendaigo Yaku Bukkyō Seiten/Buddhist Scriptures translated into modern Japanese	1953	Zaiko Bukkyō Kai	Fumio MASUTANI	Selected Scriptures from Pali Tīpīṭaka
2	Bukkyō Seiten/The Buddhist Canon	1948	Shinri Undō Honbu	Entai TOMOMATSU	"
3	Bukkyō Seiten/The Buddhist Canon	1974	Heirakuji Shoten	Shōzen KUMOI Hajime SAKURABE	"
4	Nanpō Bukkyō Kihon Seiten/The Basic Canon in Southern Buddhism	1978	Nakayama Shobō	U Wepulla	Paritta & other popular suttas in Burma

Examining Pāli academia in Japan in terms of these categories, one finds that, in the first category, the contribution made so far seems to be limited to the revision of Samantapāsādikā by Junjirō TAKAKUSU and Makoto NAGAI. In category 2, a Japanese translation of the entire Pāli Tipiṭaka was published in 65 volumes entitled *Nanden Daizō Kyō* (The Great Baskets of Canon of the Southern Tradition) between 1935 and 1941, the period marking the golden age of Pāli academia in Japan.

In categories 3, 4, and 5, more and more outstanding works have been published as research facilities have been established and staffed with capable scholars, and materials made accessible. In particular, Dr Egaku MAEDA's prominent work *Genshi Bukkyō Seiten no Seiritsushi Kenkyū* (Historical Studies of the Early Buddhist Canon, Tokyo 1964) is a must for researchers interested in the subject and will be of great use for many years. It should be added, however, that Pāli philology, unlike the case of Sanskrit, has not attracted detailed study in Japan, mainly because most Japanese Pāli scholars are trained in Buddhology and not in linguistics. Bibliographic studies, category 6, are also scarce, due to the difficulty of finding materials.

Religious movements based on Pāli Buddhism have also been scarce, since Japan is overwhelmingly a Mahāyāna country where religious organizations of the school are fairly well established, although the "Shinri Undō" (Truth Movement) led by Entai TOMOMATSU, an admirer of the Dhammapada, might be cited in this category.

Let us move on to the achievements of Japanese Pāli academia in another field, the comparative study of the Pāli and Chinese Canons. Notable achievements in this field include Masaharu ANESAKI (1873-1949) *The Four Buddhist Āgamas in Chinese* (Tokyo 1908) and Chizen AKANUMA (1884-1937) *Kan-Pa Shibu-Shiagon Goshōroku* (A Comparative Catalogue of the Chinese Āgamas and the Pāli Nikāyas, Nagoya 1929). It is no exaggeration to say that Pāli studies in Japan were advanced by the achievements in this field.

We mentioned at the start of this report that work in the original fields of Pāli studies seems mostly to have finished, and this means that Pāli scholars are groping for new research fields. Dr Kōgen MIZUNO suggests moving into studies of Aṭṭhakathā, Tīkā, and Anuṭīkā, texts postdating the Tipiṭakas, and of chronicles and commentaries on them, to promote further detailed studies of early Buddhism. He points out that it is not proper to understand Pāli Buddhism as Hinayāna—a pejorative term in China and Japan—nor to rely solely on studies of the literature. He also indicates that much can be learned by reconsidering the doctrines and practices of the Āgamas, which are the origin of Mahāyāna.

Dr Egaku MAEDA proposes launching studies of traditional Pāli Buddhism as it is practised in South and Southeast Asia today, rather than remaining confined to historical studies of the Pāli Tipiṭaka. These new Buddhist studies would freely adopt the methods of anthropology, ethnology, psychology, philosophy and social science, on the

model of some trials in Europe and the United States. His own fieldwork in the southern Buddhist countries has produced notable results.

Dr Akira HIRAKAWA also recommends breaking from conventional research methods. His suggested approach is to focus on, for example, a particular doctrine of Pāli Buddhism and to study it in all pertinent materials available.

These proposals open up innumerable subjects of study on Pāli Buddhism. And the main stream of studies on Pāli Buddhism in Japan seems to be flowing to these fields.

The following is a list of published books on Pāli Buddhist studies up to 1978; treatises published in periodicals are not included. In each group the books are arranged in chronological order.

Editor:

1. The bio-biblio of M. Anesaki can be found in the Encyclopaedia of Buddhism I, 4, pp. 613-5 (Colombo 1965).
2. Likewise, that of C. Akanuma—I, 3, pp. 337-9 (1964). He also compiled "A Comparative Index to the Samyutta-Nikāya and the Samyukta-Āgama" (*The Eastern Buddhist*, Otani University, Kyoto 1924).
3. S. Tachibana, a former Professor of Pāli and Primitive Buddhism at Komazawa University, Tokyo, obtained his D.Phil. at Oxford 1922 for a dissertation based on the Vinaya and Sutta Piṭakas—"Ethics of Pāli Buddhism". This was published by the Clarendon Press under the title *The Ethics of Buddhism* (Oxford 1926) and has been reprinted by the Bauddha Sāhitya Sabhā (Colombo 1961), Curzon Press (London 1975 and 1981) and Barnes & Noble Books (Totowa, New Jersey 1981).
4. Unless *Genshi Bukkyō* (Part 3, Table A, item 15) was subsequently revised, K. Mizuno would appear to have produced a similar work under the title *Bukkyō no Genten* (Kōsei Publishing Co., Tokyo 1974). This was translated by Richard L. Gage as *The Beginnings of Buddhism* (1980) and is distributed by Prentice/Hall International. Mizuno has also contributed the entry on "Abhidharma Literature" to the Encyclopaedia of Buddhism I, 1, pp. 64-80 (Colombo 1961) and a volume on *Primitive Buddhism* (Karinbunko, Yamaguchi-ken 1969).
5. Genjun H. Sasaki (born 1915) is Professor of Buddhism at Otani University and has written (in Japanese with an English summary) *A Study of Abhidharma Philosophy* (Kobundō, Tokyo 1958) and translated the *Sāratthasaṅgaha* (unpublished).
6. K. Higashimoto's *Elementary Grammar of the Pāli Language* was published in Tokyo 1965. Dines Andersen's *Pāli Reader* was reprinted in Kyoto 1968.
Other works in English by Japanese authors include Entai Tomamatsu *Lectures on the Dhammapada* (Kanda-dera, Tokyo 1956-59) and *Lectures on the Samyutta Rātha* (ibid. 1960), Fumimaro Watanabe (Lecturer at Kinki University and Representative for Japan of the Pāli Text Society) *Philosophy and its Development in the Nikāyas and Abhidharma* (Motilal Banarsidass, Delhi 1981; this work formed his doctoral dissertation at Toronto University 1976) and Jion Abe *Sanḥīpatthajotani Viśuddhimaggacullatīkā Sīla Dhutaṅga* (Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute, Poons 1981; his doctoral dissertation, being a study of the first and second chapters of the Visuddhimagga and its Commentaries).
7. Finally, as an example of a popular anthology based on the Vinaya and Sutta Piṭakas (apart from Mahāyāna texts), one may cite *The Teaching of Buddha* published by the Bukkyō Dendō Kyōkai (3-14, 4 chome, Shiba, Minato-ku, Tokyo 108—revised translation 1975) where, on pp. 278-9, the history of this remarkable compilation is given in full. Apart from the original Japanese text (first published in 1925 and also revised in 1975), translations also exist in French, Portuguese and Spanish.

A. Studies of the Doctrine

No.	Published		Author's Name	Book Name	(Available—*)
	Year	Place			
1	1911	Tōkyō	Masaharu ANESAKI	Kompon Bukkyō/Fundamental Buddhism	*
2	1920	Nagoya	Chizen AKANUMA	Agon no Bukkyō/Buddhism in the Agamas	
3	1923	Tōkyō	Taiken KIMURA	Genshi Bukkyō Shisō Ron/A Treatise of Thoughts on Early Buddhism	*
4	1924	"	Hakujū UI	Indo Tetsugaku Kenkyū /Studies of Indian Philosophy Vol. 2	
5	1926	"	"	" / " " Vol. 3	
6	"	"	"	" / " " Vol. 4	
7	1927	"	Tetsuro WATSUJI	Genshi Bukkyō no Jissen Tetsugaku/The Practical Philosophy in Early Buddhism	*
8	1936	Kyōto	Tetsuo TSUJIMOTO	Genshi Bukkyō niokeru Shōten Shisō no Kenkyū/A Study of the Ascension Thought in Early Buddhism	
9	1939	Nagoya	Chizen AKANUMA	Genshi Bukkyō no Kenkyū/A Study of Early Buddhism	
10	"	"	"	Bukkyō Kyōri no Kenkyū/A Study of Buddhist Doctrine	
11	1936	Tōkyō	Baiyū WATANABE	Shōjō Bukkyō/Hīnayāna Buddhism	
12	1948	"	Reihō MASUNAGA	Kompon Bukkyō no Kenkyū/A Study of Fundamental Buddhism	
13	1952	Kyōto	Issai FUNAHASHI	Genshi Bukkyō Shisō no Kenkyū/A Study of Thought in Early Buddhism	*
14	1953	Tōkyō	Giyū NISHI	Genshi Bukkyō niokeru Hannya no Kenkyū/A Study of Parāṇā in Early Buddhism	

A. Studies of the Doctrine

No.	Published		Author's Name	Book Name	
	Year	Place			
15	1956	Kyōto	Kōgen MIZUNO	Genshi Bukkyō/Early Buddhism (Sāra Sōsho)	*
16	1967	"	Shōzen KUMOI	Bukkyō Kōki Jidai no Shisō Kenkyū/A Study of Thought in the Age of Ascendancy of Buddhism	
17	1969	Tōkyō	Hajime NAKAMURA	Genshi Bukkyō no Seiritsu/The Establishment of Early Buddhism	*
18	1970	"	"	Genshi Bukkyō/Early Buddhism (NHK Books)	*
19	1970	"	"	Genshi Bukkyō no Shisō/Thought in Early Buddhism Vol. 1, 2	*
20	1970	"	Kōtatsu FUJITA	Genshi Jōdo Shisō no Kenkyū/A Study of Primitive Thought on Sukhāvatī (Paradise)	
21	1971	"	Yūshō MIYASAKA	Bukkyō no Engi/Causality in Buddhism	
22	1973	"	Keiryō YAMAMOTO	Genshi Bukkyō no Tetsugaku/Philosophy in Early Buddhism	
23	1978	"	Mitsuyoshi SAIGUSA	Shoki Bukkyō no Shisō/Thought in Early Buddhism	*

B. Studies of the Vinaya Rules

1	1960	Tōkyō	Akira HIRAKAWA	Ritsu Zō no Kenkyū/A Study of the Vinaya Pīṭaka	
2	1972	"	Mitsuo SATO	Ritsu Zō/The Vinaya Pīṭaka	*

C. Biographies of the Buddha

No.	Published		Author's Name	Book Name
	Year	Place		
1	1923	Tōkyō	Makoto NAGAI	Budda Den/A Biography of the Buddha
2	1956	"	Fumio MASUTANI	Budda/Buddha (Kadokawa-Shinsho) *
3	1958	Kyōto	Hajime NAKAMURA	Gōtama Buddha/Gotama Buddha
4	1962	Tōkyō	Fumio MASUTANI	Āgama Shiryō niyoru Butsu Den no Kenkyū/A Study of the Buddha's Biography from Āgama Materials
5	1966	"	Shōkō WATANABE	Shin Shakuson Den/A New Biography of Sakyamuni
6	1969	"	Keishō TSUKAMOTO	Budda/Buddha
7	1969	"	Hajime NAKAMURA	Gōtama Buddha/Gotama Buddha *
8	1970	"	Fumio MASUTANI	Genshi Kyōten Agon Kyō/The Early Canon: Āgama Suttas *
9	1972	"	Egaku MAEDA	Shakuson/Sakyamuni
10	1972	"	Kōgen MIZUNO	Shakuson no Shōgai/The Life of Sakyamuni *
11	1973	"	Fumio MASUTANI	Budda/Buddha (Kadokawa-Sensho) *
12	1975	"	Yūshō MIYASAKA	Shakuson/Sakyamuni

D. Studies of the Early Buddhist Order

No.	Published		Author's Name	Book Name
	Year	Place		
1	1963	Tōkyō	Mitsuo SATO	Genshi Bukkyō Kyōdan no Kenkyū/A Study of the Early Buddhist Order
2	1964	"	Kyōshō HAYASHIMA	Shoki Bukkyō to Shakai Seikatsu/Early Buddhism and Social Life
3	"	"	Akira HIRAKAWA	Genshi Bukkyō no Kenkyū/A Study of Early Buddhism
4	1966	"	Keishō TSUKAMOTO	Shoki Bukkyō Kyōdan Shi no Kenkyū/A Historical Study of the Early Buddhist Order *
5	1968	"	Shūki YOSHIMURA	Bukkyō Kyōdan no Kenkyū/A Study of the Buddhist Order
6	1972	"	Hajime NAKAMURA	Genshi Bukkyō no Seikatsu Rinri/Ethics of Life in Early Buddhism *

E. History of Buddhism and Historical Studies of Buddhist Doctrine

1	1940	Tōkyō	Tenzui UEDA	Kairitsu Shisō Shi/History of Thought on the Vinaya
2	1975	"	Kōtatsu FUJITA & others	Ajia Bukkyō Shi-Indo-hen II-'Genshi-Bukkyō-to-Buha-Bukkyō'/History of Buddhism in Asia-India II-'Early Buddhism and Scholastic Buddhism' *
3	1978	"	Genjun SASAKI	Genshi Bukkyō kara Daijō Bukkyō e/From Early Buddhism to Mahāyāna Buddhism *
4	"	Kyōtō	Masao SHIZUTANI	Shōjō Bukkyō Shi no Kenkyū/A Study of Hīnayāna Buddhism

F. Studies of the Buddhist Canon

No.	Published		Author's Name	Book Name
	Year	Place		
1	1922	Tōkyō	Makoto NAGAI	Konpon Butten no Kenkyū/A Study of the Fundamental Canon
2	1939	Nagoya	Chizen AKANUMA	Bukkyō Kyōten Shi Ron/Comments on the History of the Buddhist Canon *
3	1954	Tōkyō	Ryūshō HIGATA	Honjōkyō Rui no Shisōshi teki Kenkyū/A Historical Study of Thought on the Jātaka Stories
4	1964	"	Egaku MAEDA	Genshi Bukkyō Seiten no Seiritsushi Kenkyū/A Historical Study of the Early Buddhist Canon *
5	1972	"	Ryūshō HIGATA	Jātaka Gaikan/A Summary of the Jātaka (Padoma Sōsho)

G. The Present State of Southern Buddhism

1	1942	Tōkyō	Shōshin TATSUYAMA	Nanpō Bukkyō no Yōtai/Aspects of Southern Buddhism
2	1963	Kyōto	Kyōgo SASAKI	Kōza Kindai Bukkyō I/Modern Buddhism Lecture Series No. 1
3	1969	"	Yoneo ISHII	Kairitsu no Sukui/Salvation by the Vinaya (Religions of the World Series No. 8) *
4	1973	Tōkyō	Kyōgo SASAKI & others	Ajia Bukkyō Shi—Indo-hen VI—'Tōnan Ajia no Bukkyō'/History of Buddhism in Asia—India VI—'Buddhism in Southeast Asia' *
5	1975	"	Zenno IKUNO	Biruma Bukkyō/Buddhism in Burma (Daizō-Sensho)
6	"	"	Yoneo ISHII	Jōzabu Bukkyō no Seiji Shakai Gaku/The Political Sociology of Theravāda Buddhism (Tōnan Ajia Kenkyū Sōsho) *
7	1977	Kyōto	Jikai FUJIYOSHI	Nānpō-Bukkyō/Southern Buddhism

H. Studies of the Abhidhamma

1	1925	Tōkyō	Taiken KIMURA	Abidatsuma Ronsho no Kenkyū/A Study of the Abhidhamma Piṭaka
2	1934	"	Kōgen MIZUNO	Nanpō Jōzabu Ronsho Kaisetsu/A Commentary on the Abhidhamma Books of the Southern Theravāda School
3	1936	"	Makoto NAGAI	Nanpō Shoden Butten no Kenkyū/A Study of the Buddhist Canon of the Southern Tradition
4	1960	"	Genjun SASAKI	Bukkyō Shinrigaku no Kenkyū/A Study of the Psychology of Buddhism
5	1964	"	Kōgen MIZUNO	Pāri Bukkyō o Chūshin toshita Bukkyō no Shinshiki Ron/The Buddhist Views on Mind Consciousness mainly in Pāli Buddhism *
6	1972	"	Genjun SASAKI	Abidatsuma Shisō Kenkyū/ A Study of Abhidhamma Thought

I. Comparative Studies of Buddhism

1	1925	Tōkyō	Baiyū WATANABE	Zō Agon Kyō/Samyutta Āgama Suttas
2	1929	Nagoya	Chizen AKANUMA	Kan-Pa Shibu Shigon Goshōroku/A Comparative Catalogue of the Chinese Āgama & Pāli Nikāyas
3	1959 -'61	Tōkyō	Kōgen MIZUNO	Nanden Daizō Kyō Sō-Sakuin/Index to 'Nanden Daizō/Kyō' (The Southern Tipitaka) I-1, I-2, II
4	1968	Wakayama	Jikken NIU	Hokku Kyō no Taishō Kenkyū/ A Comparative Study of the Dhammapada

J. Pāli Language (Readers, Grammars, Dictionaries)

1	1900	Tōkyō	Junjirō TAKAKUSU	Pāri-Go Bukkyō Bungaku Kōhon;—Jisho/Japanese Version of 'A Pāli Chrestomathy with Notes and Glossary' **
2	1910	"	Shundō TACHIBANA	Pāri-Go Buntan/A Grammar of the Pāli Language
3	1930	"	Makoto NAGAI	Dokushū Pāri-Go Bupō/Pāli Grammar Self-Taught
4	"	Nagoya	Chizen AKANUMA	Indo-Bukkyō Koyū Meishi Jiten/A Dictionary of Proper Names in Indian Buddhism
5	1955	Tōkyō	Kōgen MIZUNO	Pāri-Go Bupō/A Grammar of the Pāli Language
6	1956	"	"	Pāri-Go Bukkyō Dokuhon/A Buddhist Reader in Pāli
7	1960	Kyōto	Shōzen KUMOI	Pā-Wa Shō Jiten/Compact Pāli-Japanese Dictionary
8	1968	Tōkyō	Kōgen MIZUNO	Pāri-Go Jiten/Pāli-Japanese Dictionary *
9	1977	"	Genjun SASAKI Satoshi NONOME	Kihon Pāri-Go Bupō/An Elementary Pāli Grammar *

**This contains most of the *paritta* texts and extracts from the Pāli Canon and Commentaries, studies of the Pāli and Chinese recensions, and a Pāli-Sanskrit-Chinese glossary.

K. Translations

			Author's Name	Title of Japanese Translation	Author & Title of Original Book
1	1908	Tōkyō	Ryō MINAMI	Budda	H. Oldenberg: Buddha, seine Leben, seine Lehre, seine Gemeinde (Berlin 1881)
2	1913	"	Shundō TACHIBANA	Bukkyō Taikō	H. Kern: Manual of Indian Buddhism (Strassburg 1896)
3	1920	"	Chizen AKANUMA	Bigandē-shi Biruma Butsuden	P. Bigandet: The Life or Legend of Gaudama (London 1858)
4	1923	"	Gishō NAKANO Manoru OSARAGI	Indo Bukkyō Bungaku Shi	M. Winternitz: Geschichte der Indischen Literatur, Bd. II (Leipzig 1913)
5	"	"	Shigenobu SUZUKI	Budda no Shōgai to Shisō	R. Pischel: Leben und Lehre des Buddha (Leipzig 1906)
6	1928	"	Taiken KIMURA Tetsuo KAGEYAMA	Budda	Same as No. 1
7	1930	"	Junjirō TAKAKUSU Tetsuo KAWAI	Upanishaddo yori Bukkyō made	H. Oldenberg: Die Lehre der Upanishaden und die Anfänge des Buddhismus (Göttingen 1915)
8	1943	"	Shōkō WATANABE	Budda	H. Beckh: Buddhismus, Buddha und seine Lehre (Berlin and Leipzig 1928)
9	1962	"	"	Bukkyō (Jo): Dai-1-bu Budda (Iwanami-Bunko)	" *
10	1972	Wakayama	Gishō NAKANO	Indo no Gakujutsu Sho	Same as No. 4, Vol. III
11	1977	Tōkyō	Shōkō WATANABE Shigeaki WATANABE	Bukkyō (Ge): Dai-2-bu Kyōri (Iwanami-Bunko)	Same as No. 8 *
12	1978	Wakayama	Gishō NAKANO	Bukkyō Bunken	Same as No. 4

NIMITTA: THE BEGINNING AND THE END

Caroline Sherwood

To explore this subject which is at the same time both simple and basic to any understanding of meditation and also immensely subtle and complex, I would like to begin with some classical Buddhist definitions and then go on to discuss their implications in terms of the experience of the meditator.

The Pali word *nimitta* has been defined as follows: "a psychological term denoting the mental attributes of sentient existence"¹ More generally "that which marks or indicates".² We can draw four main groups of meaning for this word which are relevant to the present purpose:³

Firstly, *nimitta* can imply an object presented to one of the six 'sense doors'.

Secondly, it can refer to a 'condition of existence'.

Thirdly, it can mean the 'outward appearance' of phenomena.

Fourthly, it is used to denote a 'mental image' in meditation, which appears out of mental clarity.

So we begin with the outward sign and apparent characteristics of things and objects. We begin with the *nimitta* which determines our mental disposition—*nimitta-karaṇa-dhamma*⁴—based in acquisitiveness, aversion, or confusion. We begin with the raw material of emotional, physical and mental chaos. We begin with the human condition. We bring this to our practice. All our tendencies to aggression, anger, fear, greed, jealousy, pride—these are our emotional manure; the fuel for our meditation.

As we embark upon the practice of meditation we enter into the area of the fourth definition of *nimitta*. We learn gradually how to dissociate from identification with transient phenomena. One who has sense control 'he does not seize upon the general appearance' of an object.⁵ At this stage we begin, in technical, doctrinal terms, to encounter 'The Mark of Calm'—*Samatha-nimitta*.⁶ The appearance of this mark develops through three distinct stages.

We start at the beginning with a *selected meditational device*—selected in the Theravāda tradition, from one of forty subjects for meditation. This device provides the first *nimitta* and corresponds directly to our initial mental disposition. This is the stage of *Parikammanimitta*. After periods

1. *Buddhist Meditation in Theory and Practice*. Paravahera Vajirañāṇa (repr. Kuala Lumpur 1975)

2. *Ibid.*

3. *Buddhist Dictionary*. Nyanatiloka Mahāthera (repr. BPS, Kandy 1978)

4. *Buddhist Meditation*

5. *Buddhist Dictionary*

6. *Buddhist Meditation*

of long concentration this is replaced by a mental image—*Uggaha-nimitta*—which is "established in the mind like something learnt."⁷ It still bears, however, the blemishes of the original object. Both the device and the mental image are termed Preliminary Concentration—*Parikamma-Samādhi*. The mental image in its turn gives way to an abstract idea or concept—*paññā*⁸—which produces the After Image—*Paṭibhāga-nimitta*. "Divested of phenomenal reality and free from all the faults of the original object and becomes a sublimated image which yet embodies the quality of objectivity."⁸ This can arise only when the mind has reached the state known as Access Concentration—*Upacāra-Samādhi*. This state, it is said, can arise from the completion of twenty two meditations on the following:

The Ten *Kasina* Devices:

Earth
Water
Fire
Air
Blue
Yellow
Red
White
Light
Space

The Ten *Asubhas* or Impurities:

A swollen corpse
A discoloured corpse
A festering corpse
A fissured corpse
A mangled corpse
A dismembered corpse
A cut and dismembered corpse
A bleeding corpse
A worm infested corpse
A skeleton

Ānāpāna-Sati or Mindfulness of Respiration and *Kāyagata-Sati* or Mindfulness of the Body.

How does all this apply to the experience of the meditator and his or her mental quality?

The first thing to be understood is that where we start in meditation is also where we end. We view the same phenomena; the same basic situation, but from a fresh and different standpoint. We engage in a sort of motionless travel or moving stillness. We are not changed. We are 'alchemically' transformed.

7. *Ibid.*

8. *Ibid.*

The way to achieve the necessary dissociation from the tangle of phenomena is by a delicate and subtle process of *penetration*. One goes to the heart of the energy and 'explodes' it, as it were, from the inside. This is a process of redirection and transmutation. Not of catharsis. The energy is recognised as pure and redistributed as nourishment and wholesome states such as wisdom or compassion. This process arises from a central *nimitta* of clarity.

The experiential leap to be made here can only come about through the workings of our basic intelligence. It cannot be reached through intellectualisation.

We have to understand the nature of a single point, a single moment. We then experience this singularity as containing all other points. This centre permeates and is the true nature of all states. It comprehends and includes the darkest negativity and pain as well as the lightest bliss. It judges neither for they are of its basic nature. It is not separate from them. "There is only one centre and everything becomes the centre."

Meditation is the process of removing the trappings of conceptualisation from our experience. This leads to the clarity from which *nimitta* arises. Nothing has to be done with this singular experience. It does not have to be 'applied'. It is sufficient unto itself and works its own magic.

This leap is one of direct insight and is untranslatable. It concerns the realisation that all time is present here in this moment and the present experience is totally entwined with one's presence in the experience. It is not possible to separate the perceiver from the perceived.

One passes from a time oriented, linear perspective into an infinitely spacious, multi-dimensional experience. Self as a central concern is no longer experienced as relevant. All energy becomes an object of consciousness. Consciousness is not personalised. This understanding however, contains everything that lead to it.

All time is now.

Nimitta is now.

All space is here.

Nimitta is here.

All knowledge is here and now.

Nimitta is here and now.

At the heart of Dukkha—

Nimitta.

At the heart of Nimitta—

Suñnatā.

THE SIGNIFICANCE OF THE BRAHMAVIHARAS IN THERAVADA BUDDHISM

Arvind Sharma

I

An emphasis on various kinds of meditation is characteristic of Early Buddhism.¹ It is possible to make most of these various meditational techniques fit into a pattern connected with the eightfold path.² The purpose of this paper is to analyze the location and significance of the meditation on the four *brahmavihāras* in this context.³

II

The question of the location of the *brahmavihāras* is answered more easily than that of their significance. In the *Visuddhimagga* of Buddhaghosa, the *Brahmavihāra*—*iddesa* precedes the *Aruppa*—*iddesa*⁴ so "This form of concentration is placed by Buddhaghosa immediately before the attainments of the Formless World".⁵ Moreover, the last of the four *brahmavihāras* is Even-mindedness "to which we may according to tradition, successfully aspire only after we have repeatedly attained the third *dhyāna* with regard to the first three emotional states"⁶—Friendliness, Compassion and Sympathetic Joy.

In other words, the lateral point of contact of the meditation on the *brahmavihāras*, or the illimitables (*apramāṇāni*) as they are sometimes called, with the system of *jhānas* which compose *samādhi* (the last step of the eightfold path), may be presented thus:

Friendliness

First Jhāna

Compassion

Second Jhāna

1. Walpola Rahula *What the Buddha Taught* (Bedford: Gordon Fraser Gallery Ltd, 1967), Chapter VII; Edward Conze, tr. *Buddhist Scriptures* (Baltimore: Penguin Books, 1959), Chapter 2; Nalinaksha Dutt *Early Monastic Buddhism* (Calcutta: Oriental Book Agency, 1960), Chapter VIII; etc.

2. Bhikkhu Nanamoli, tr. *The Path of Purification I* (Berkeley: Shambhala, 1976) Part II; Lanza Anagarika Govinda *The Psychological Attitude of Early Buddhist Philosophy* (London: Rider & Company, 1961), Fourth Part; David J. Kalupahana *Causality: The Central Philosophy of Buddhism* (Honolulu: University Press of Hawaii, 1975), Chapter IX; Edward J. Thomas *The History of Buddhist Thought* (New York: Barnes & Noble Inc., 1971), Chapter IV; etc.

3. For a discussion of the term see Har Dayal *The Bodhisattva Doctrine in Buddhist Sanskrit Literature* (Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1975), pp. 226-228; for its relation to Brahmanism see Edward J. Thomas *The Life of Buddha as Legend and History* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1975), pp. 126-127.

4. Bhikkhu Nanamoli, op. cit., pp. 321, 354.

5. Edward J. Thomas *The Life of Buddha as Legend and History*, p. 127.

6. Edward Conze *Buddhism: Its Essence and Development* (New York: Harper & Row, 1959), p. 102.

Sympathetic Joy

Third Jhāna

Evenmindedness =
upekkhāFourth Jhāna
= upekkhā-ekaggatā

III

But what exactly is the significance of this connection?

It seems that the key to the answer is provided by the realization that "The chief purpose of Buddhism is the extinction of separate individuality which is brought about when we cease to *identify* anything with ourselves".⁷ This deindividuation can be carried out in two ways: either by dissolving the centre or so extending the circumference that its limits (the limit of individuality) disappear into the unlimited. The Jhānas seem to raise the consciousness to a point where the centre dissolves; the meditation on the four illimitables tries to achieve the same effect, it seems, by dissolving the circumference of our personality. Either way a stage of Evenmindedness results after which the seeker is ready to focus entirely on transcending the realm of form. At this point, by either route, personal preferences have become so diffuse or rarefied that they become imperceptible, resulting in Evenmindedness.

IV

The Brahmavihāras, however, do not possess significance from the point of view of *samādhi* alone; they can, it seems, also be brought in relation to *śīla*. Here they seem to have the effect of reducing the effects of past *karma* and thus rendering Nirvāṇa more accessible. The following passage from the Aṅguttara Nikāya seems to provide the necessary link in this connection:

"There, disciples, a certain person has only committed a small crime, and this brings him to hell. There, however, disciples, another has committed the same small crime, but this ripens during his lifetime, and not even a small effect manifests itself, to say nothing of a great one. . ."

"But of which kind, disciples, is the man whom a small crime which he has committed brings to hell? There, disciples, a man has not won insight into the body, has not practised himself in virtue, has not developed his mind, not awakened knowledge, is narrow-minded, small-minded, and so has to suffer even in consequence of trifles. Such a man, disciples, even a small crime which he has committed may bring to hell."

"But of which kind, disciples, is the man in whom the same small crime which he has committed will ripen even during his life-time, and in whom not even a small effect (after death) ensues, to say nothing of a great one? There, disciples, a man has won insight into the body, has practised himself in virtue,

7. *Ibid.*, p. 106.

has developed his mind, has awakened knowledge, is broad-minded, magnanimous, dwelling in the Immeasurable. In such a man, disciples, the same small crime which he has committed ripens even during his life-time, and not even a small effect manifests itself (after death) to say nothing of a great one."

"What do you think, disciples: Suppose a man throws a lump of salt into a small cup of water, would then the little water in that cup through this lump of salt become saltish and undrinkable?"

"Yes, Lord."

"And why so?"

"There is only very little water in the cup, Lord. So it would become saltish and undrinkable through this lump of salt."

"But what do you think, disciples: Suppose a man should throw a lump of salt into the river Ganges, would the water of the Ganges then become saltish and undrinkable through this lump of salt?"

"Certainly not, Lord."

"And why not?"

"There is, Lord, an immense quantity of water in the river Ganges. So, through that lump of salt, it would not become saltish and undrinkable."

"Just so, disciples, one man has only committed a small crime, and it brings him to hell. And another man has committed the same small crime, but it *ripens even during his life-time*, and not even a small effect manifests itself (after death), to say nothing of a great one."⁸

George Grimm explains the significance of this passage in the light of the four Immeasurables. He points out that in the case of a vain man even a slight insult may produce such "inextinguishable traces" as lead to several births whereas in a "noble-hearted person, the same insult will make no impression, or, if it does excite him this excitement will only be momentary, and the influence upon his will brought about by this excitement will very soon *ripen* into bitter repentance, work itself out and through the kindness and compassion dwelling in him will be completely dried out in the shortest time".⁹ This leads George Grimm to remark on the opening para of the citation from the Book of Threes above: "This means: In one man a certain willing, manifesting itself in

8. As cited in M. Keller-Grimm and Max Hoppe, eds. *The Doctrine of the Buddha. The Religion of Reason and Meditation* (Berlin: Akademie Verlag, 1958), pp. 197-198.

9. *Ibid.*, p. 198.

a crime, acts beyond death in such wise as may bring him directly to hell, whereas with another it exhausts itself completely during his lifetime, and does not exhibit even a small *post-mortem* effect".¹⁰ Thus attenuation of the karmic effect George Grimm connects with kindness and compassion, which he points out are the "Immeasurables. . . wherein all egotism is dissolved, as is a lump of salt in the river Ganges".¹¹

V

To conclude: the significance of the Brahmavihāras is twofold: they dilute karmic consequences and they dilute the individuality to which *karma* clings and thus help achieve that de-individualisation which opens the path to Nirvāṇa.¹²

NIETZSCHE AND BUDDHISM *

Russell Webb

Of all the European post-Enlightenment thinkers following in the wake of the new-found knowledge of Indian philosophy, the most persistently misunderstood is Friedrich Nietzsche (1844-1900). Since he died young and in a mental asylum, it is tempting to ascribe his seemingly self-contradictory writings on Buddhism to the effects of schizophrenia rather than to the profound workings of a logical and imaginative mind beyond the comprehension of all but a perceptive few.

Lucid understanding presupposes access to, familiarity with and insight into the original source materials of whatever system of thought has been made the subject of study. In the present case especially one may recall the Parable of the Blind Men and the Elephant¹ to illustrate the drawbacks of partial knowledge. Thus, Hare² and Ladner³ wrote unsympathetic accounts of Nietzsche vis-à-vis Buddhism although the true explanation for any shortcoming in the latter's understanding undoubtedly lay in the simple fact that few Pali and Sanskrit texts were available, either in romanised or translated form, and fewer still of reliable European exegeses.

Even Schopenhauer (1788-1860), who attracted a sizeable and influential following extending to the early part of this century, could be criticised for confusing essentially Vedāntic concepts with those of the Buddhādhamma. However, Nāṇajivako⁴ has ably crystallised his ideas and presented a convincing case in favour of his correct understanding of the Dhamma. Moreover, the author performed an invaluable service by cataloguing all the published works on Buddhism available to Schopenhauer and found in his library.⁵ In the work under review Mistry

* Prolegomenon to a Comparative Study. Freny Mistry. Monographien und Texte zur Nietzsche-Forschung 6. Walter de Gruyter, Berlin 1981. 211 pp. DM 82

1. Udāna 68-9

2. Lotus Hare "Nietzsche's Critique of Buddhism". *The Buddhist Review* VIII, London 1916

3. Max Ladner *Nietzsche und der Buddhismus*. Zurich 1933

4. *Schopenhauer and Buddhism*. BPS, Kandy 1970

5. List revised by the writer: I. J. Schmidt contributed the following papers to the *Bulletin scientifique de l'Académie de St. Pétersbourg* and *Mémoires de l'Académie de St. Pétersbourg*—"Über einige Grundlehren des Buddhismus" (*Mémoires* I, 1829), "Über die sogenannte dritte Welt der Buddhisten" (*ibid.* 1830), "Über die tausend Buddhas einer Weltperiode oder gleichmässigen Dauer" (tr. Bhadrakalpikāsūtra, *ibid.*), "Über Lamaismus und die Bedeutungslosigkeit dieses Namens" (*Bulletin* I, 1832), "Über das Mahājāna und Pradschnā-pāramitā der Bauddha" (tr. Vajracchedikā Prajñāpāramitāsūtra, *ibid.*) and "Kritischer Versuch zur Feststellung der Aera und der ersten geschichtlichen Momente des Buddhismus" (*ibid.*, 1837); Csomsde Kōrōs "Analysis of the Dulva" (—Vinaya in the Tibetan Kanjur, *Asiatic Researches* 20, II, Calcutta 1836); E. Burnouf *L'Introduction à l'histoire du Bouddhisme indien* (Paris 1844); P. E. Foucaux *Rgya-cher-ralpa* (tr. Lalitavistara, 2 vols., Paris 1847-8); F. Spiegel *Liber de officiis sacerdotum Buddhorum* (—Upasampadā Kammavācā, Bonn 1841) and *Anecdota Palica* (—Uraga Sutta, Sutta-Nipāta, with extracts from the Commentary and the Rasavāhinī, Leipzig 1845); F. Buchanan-Hamilton "On the Religion and

10. *Ibid.*, p. 197.

11. *Ibid.*, p. 198, footnote.

12. One should note that these meditations may serve somewhat different ends in Mahāyāna Buddhism when connected with the *bodhisattva* (see Edward Conze, "The Mahāyāna," in R. C. Zaehner, ed. *The Concise Encyclopedia of Living Faiths* Boston: Beacon Press, 1959], p. 304; Har Dayal, *op. cit.*, p. 228).

repeats the exercise on behalf of Nietzsche.⁶

Apart from the objective study of Welbon,⁷ which is not referred to, the present work represents the only full-length study of its kind. Its author, who has lectured on German and comparative literature at Indiana University, begins her thesis by refuting the popular misconception that Nietzsche was necessarily opposed to Buddhism, despite the fact that (in common with all 19th century scholars) he was disadvantaged by the lack of first-hand materials on the subject. Some positive statements, taken from *The Antichrist*, are then quoted on pp. 6-7: "...the 'self-deception of moral concepts' lies far behind Buddhism. It is 'beyond good and evil' and a hundred times more realistic than Christianity. It encounters problems objectively, coolly and truthfully. It is the only genuinely 'positivistic' religion in history, strictly 'phenomenalistic' and pragmatic in its outlook. It bears a deference for reality and so rules out the paralysing threat of sin. It prescribes hygienic measures to overcome depressing physiological conditions and is intended to preserve mental health. It counteracts dejection, counsels moderation, the wariness of all intoxicants as also of all emotions that activate the gall-bladder and heat the blood. It is opposed to worry. It develops ideas which are soothing and encouraging. The Buddha is a 'physiologist' par excellence and his religion a 'system of hygiene'. He understands goodness and graciousness as health-promoting. He rules out prayer and extreme asceticism and does not advocate subscription to imperatives or compulsions of any sort. He bans hostility and strife with those who think otherwise. He insists upon the overcoming of revenge, antipathy, ill-will. In opposition to outer action, Buddhism stresses inner strenuousness and vigilance. ... It is cheerful, calm, and advocates a 'freedom from desire', a goal which is attainable and attained. 'Perfection', for Buddhism, is a constant reality, unaffected by vague hopes and longings impossible to fulfill". And on pp. 9-10: "The conclusion arrived at in this study is the reverse of Ladner's: Nietzsche and the Buddha spoke differently, but their message is recognisably affiliated and attests to the proximity of their ethical philosophy. Apart from the ambivalence of Nietzsche's reactions to Buddhism, his personal stance on metaphysics as represented by his denial of an extra-terrestrial godhead, antipathy for dogma and absolutism, experimentation with truth and reason, analysis of personality, advocacy of 'perspectivism' and his implementation and presentation of dialectic, is proximate if not occasionally interchangeable with that of original Buddhism".

Literature of the Burma." (*Asiatic Researches* 6, Calcutta 1799); V. Sangermano *The Burmese Empire* (Rome 1833); G. Turnour (tr. first 38 chapters of *The Mahāvamsa* (Colombo 1837); E. Upham *The History and Doctrine of Buddhism* (London 1829) and (tr.) the *Rājāratnācarī* and *Rājāvalī* etc. (3 vols., London 1833); R. Spence Hardy *Eastern Monachism* (London 1850) and *Manual of Buddhism* (London 1853).

6. H. Oldenberg *Buddha* (found in his library), C. F. Köppen *Die Religion des Buddha* (2 vols., Berlin 1857-59—read 1870-1), H. Kern *Der Buddhismus und seine Geschichte in Indien* (Leipzig 1884), F. Max Müller *Essays II* (on Comparative Religion, Leipzig 1869—in his library) and the *Sutta-Nipāta* (tr. V. Fausbøll, SBE, Oxford 1880).

7. G. R. Welbon "Schopenhauer, Wagner and Nietzsche on Nirvāṇa" (*The Buddhist Nirvāṇa and Its Western Interpreters*, University of Chicago Press 1968).

Nietzsche repudiated the existence of a metaphysical Reality and thereby corrected Schopenhauer's mistaken identity of this with Buddhism. Moreover, the former was well acquainted with the fundamentals of Indian philosophy from the writings of Paul Deussen, a lifelong friend to whom he introduced the works of Schopenhauer. Indeed, he made a comparison in attitudes in time: "...four thousand years ago man in India thought more profoundly and transmitted universally a greater delight in thinking than contemporary Europe could show" (p. 35)—a fact even more noticeable a century later! Europe, he observed, is still far removed from a stage of culture whereby a "teacher of a religion of self-redemption" could arise, dependent as it was on the concepts of God and soul and clerical efficacy (which characterised the pre-Buddhist sub-continent). However, "the fact that 'God, morality, resignation', which once were crutches to man in his deepest misery, are now being discarded, is the encouraging sign of a certain level of intellectual culture and relative well-being in Europe. ..." "Consider the situation in which the Buddha appeared: the teaching of the Eternal Recurrence would presuppose scholarly principles (as the Buddha's teaching, e.g. the notion of causality, etc.)" (p. 36).

"From Nietzsche's rejection of the metaphysical categories of God, Being, All-Soul and Immortality it is but a step to his denial of man as 'individual' or 'subject' incorporating a 'soul' or 'spirit' in the suprarational sense of an unidentifiable essential substance reflecting the cosmos and opposed to matter" (p. 51). Then follows a succinct and lucid explanation of the philosopher's interpretation of *anatta*; although the Buddha's doctrine is admitted as being more systematically constructed, both teachers declare the 'individual' to be a fictitious representation and... offer an interpretation of man attuned to the empirical framework of impermanence" (p. 51). Nietzsche's definition of non-ego is summed up on p. 70 whilst shortly before the term *cetanā* is equated with his (understandably misleading) "will to power" which is viewed as the continual struggle with and overcoming of the baser desires and motivating forces.

"The belief that thinking is an activity which must presuppose a subject... is... a consequence of the belief in conventional grammar." Thus, "there is no thinker behind the thought, that thought itself is the thinker and that if it is discarded no thinker is discernible." (p. 93).

In passing, it should be pointed out that the Nietzschean refrain, "Thus spoke Zarathustra", correctly corresponds to the terminal Pāli canonical refrain, "Thus spoke the Buddha"—not, as the author assumes, "Thus have I heard", which begins each Buddhist discourse.

That Nietzsche railed against *sīla* stemmed from his equating its parent with *ucchedavāda* (p. 100ff), a view which was largely communicated by contemporaries. Moreover, as the author plausibly argues, "...it is doubtful that the bulk of vociferous criticisms into which the Buddha is drawn are seriously pondered reactions to Buddhism per se.

They strike us more readily as negative reactions to the 'cult' of Buddhism as Nietzsche found it fostered by the world-view of a Schopenhauer or a Wagner, correspondingly, reactions against the lack of spiritual direction in Europe. In view of his attacks on modernism, moreover, it seems reasonable to conclude that it is not Buddhism which he psychologically flagellates, but the warm if ambivalent reception of a philosophy only half-understood in his times" (p. 115). Mistry continues: "Nietzsche's life and writings reveal suffering as also overcoming to have been an intense personal need and experience. His insistence on the embrace of suffering as an existential and an ethical imperative owes concurrently to his psychological study of his fellow man in whom he diagnosed a desire to 'bypass' affliction, to compulsively suppress his experience of it and to view it in the perspective of shame. Nietzsche's concentration upon affliction then is intended both as self-criticism and as an admonition to those who fear themselves, who can admit only what is agreeable, who seek to level everything and whose lives reveal the sole pursuit of outer happiness; also to those who seek to evade pain by constructing a world of values from which hardship is absent; who seek distraction and engage themselves in mass-oriented activities for fear of solitude; who seek compensation and relief in 'small joys' such as benevolence, gift-giving, relieving, helping, consoling, praising, and so forth. The great infirmity of modern man, in Nietzsche's diagnosis, is his inability to suffer unattended and so to create his own redemption." (pp. 116-7). Nevertheless, "An examination of the Buddhist perspective of suffering reveals that Nietzsche's repudiation of Buddhism's supposedly 'enervating' preoccupation with pain to the exclusion of human aspiration and striving derives from a misconception of the Buddhist perspective. In part, this misconstruction is attributable to the lack of adequate information available to Nietzsche on what the term *dukkha* implies in Buddhism. Moreover, he interprets the Buddhist view of human affliction in terms of Schopenhauer's bitterness and contempt for the superficialities of existence. In his first sermon held at Benares the Buddha proclaimed *dukkha*, suffering in its most comprehensive form, to be the all-encompassing reality of life; this insight was to be implemented by the ethical culture of 'moderation' outlined in an 'Eightfold Path' to self-redemption" (p. 120). The author then ably clarifies the meaning of *dukkha* with reference to the works of Govinda, W. Rahula and Stcherbatsky.

Nietzsche's key concept of the "Eternal Recurrence" (of suffering and overcoming) denies the Buddhist doctrine of causality: "...no one gives man his qualities—neither God, nor society, nor his parents and ancestors, nor he himself. . . No one is responsible for man's being there at all, for his being such-and-such, or for his being in these circumstances or in this environment. The fatality of his essence is not to be disentangled from the fatality of all that has been and all that will be. Man is not the consequence of his own intention, of a will, a purpose—he is not the object of an attempt to attain an 'ideal of man' or an 'ideal of happiness' or an 'ideal of morality'. It is absurd to want to devolve his essence on some purpose or other. We have invented the concept 'purpose': in reality the purpose is lacking. . ." (p. 144). Elsewhere, however, he is seen to have accepted rebecoming and to have denied the transference of a soul

entity; moreover, his own interpretation of man's (dependent) progress through Samsāra would appear to have been derived from Oldenberg's *Buddha* as referred to in *Thus spoke Zarathustra*: "Nietzsche accentuates the reality of human suffering and the creativity to which it impels the individual and this is what his will to power affirms. The affirmation itself becomes genuine when the temptation of relying upon a ruling and determining force external to the human will is withstood". (p. 156).

The substance of his philosophy may best be summed up by quoting direct from both propounder and interpreter on pp. 156-7: "...the value of the world lies in our interpretations; . . . each elevation of man brings with it the overcoming of narrower interpretations; that each intensification and increase of power arrived at opens up new perspectives and calls for belief in new horizons—this idea permeates my writings" (*The Will to Power* 616)". "The harmonisation of disharmonic existence and individual will signifies the test of endurance, of creativity beyond and despite oneself. Overcoming, interpretation, endurance, and the love of fate are interchangeable realities—each fortifying and sustaining the other."

The overcoming of *dukkha* is invested with a positive directive. "Power, as art, in Nietzsche's view, involves man's striving for redemption through the creative transformation of suffering" (p. 172). "Power, then, in the Nietzschean sense, does not signify an end. It is found in humanity's 'highest examples'. It lies in the 'process' of overcoming which knows no finality, only a continuity of the challenge, notwithstanding the victory of the will. Great moments of joy are inherent in this process. They are themselves not 'ends' but objectives periodically attained in the process of overcoming: 'And this secret life itself delivered to me. . . I am that which must always overcome itself'" (p. 173). The remaining section would seem to exemplify the *samurai* spirit, an elitist tone which reminds the reader of the equally profound monograph on *The Doctrine of Awakening* by Evola. Nietzsche's remarkably "Buddhist" approximation to the four Right Efforts is illustrated on p. 175.

This is not an easy work to read or understand as may be evidenced by the chapters which constitute it: "I The overcoming of metaphysics and nihilism, II The analysis of personality and universe, III The experiment with truth and reason, IV On suffering, V The ethics of the Eternal Recurrence, VI The transfiguration of suffering and nirvana". Moreover, the use of some archaic terms and even alien "English" expressions mar the otherwise even prose—e.g. "averageness" (p. 117) for mediocrity, "imposthume" (?p. 132) and "indissociable" (p. 137). In the footnote on p. 183 the terms "Sthaviravada" and "Mahasangha" are correctly "Sarvāstivāda" and "Mahāsāṃghika" respectively; and on p. 186, line 6, *rāhula* simply connotes "bond" or "obstruction" (implicit in the preceding passage) and not "little demon" (mistakenly derived from *Rāhu*, the name of an asura)!

The author's Buddhist bibliography is severely limited but perhaps this is not to be expected otherwise in view of the specific theme. Thus

she has relied largely on two authorities which span Theravādin exegetical material in the West: *Buddha. Sein Leben, seine Lehre, seine Gemeinde* (2nd edn, Berlin 1890) by Hermann Oldenberg and *What the Buddha Taught* (New York 1962) by Walpoia Rahula.

Since reviewing Mistry's study, the writer was fortunate to obtain an advance copy of a lucid and sympathetic paper by Steven Heine—"Dionysus against the Buddha: Nietzsche's 'Yes' and the Buddhist 'No'"—contained in *Buddhist and Western Philosophy* (ed Nathan Katz, Sterling Publishers, New Delhi 1981) which will be reviewed in a future issue. Since it clarifies a number of issues discussed by Mistry, extracts from the paper are reproduced here:

"More than Nietzsche realizes, his philosophy is strikingly similar to Buddhism in their denial of substance, the soul, the universal, and duration in favour of a view of the world made up of phenomena arising interdependently. They both analyze suffering in terms of a deceptive maze of onesided misconceptions generated by ontological dis-orientation; and they propose liberation from the bondage of ignorance through the mastery of unconscious drives and the attainment of an eternal state absolutely free from attachment to things and to the self, transcendent of all duality, detached from mundane concerns yet infinitely creative. Also, Nietzsche and Buddhism share a disdain for non-edifying metaphysical speculation, theoretical knowledge as its own end, extreme asceticism, and ritual; a refusal to communicate that which cannot be spoken without distortion; an abandonment of theism as a false projection of subjective weaknesses and ideals; the full comprehending and overcoming of nihilism". (p. 246).

"The basis of eternal recurrence is the certainty that whatever happens in one's own life and the entire history of the world has already occurred and will continue to recur eternally in all of its details exactly the same as it is occurring now". (p. 245).

"By will to power, Nietzsche, does not mean the kind of selfish clinging or volitional greed for self-preservation which the Buddha rejects. 'Willing is not desiring, striving, demanding; it is distinguished from these by the effect of commanding.' It is essentially the instinct to freedom in all things, the potentiality for overcoming and perfecting oneself, not merely a drive to preserve and protect one's territory". (p. 253).

NEWS & NOTES

Pali Text Society

1. New Office-bearers

Following the demise of Miss Horner, the new President is K. R. Norman, Reader in Indian Studies (specialising in Pali and Prakrit) at Cambridge, whilst his successor as Hon. Secretary is R. F. Gombrich, Boden Professor of Sanskrit at Oxford, but noted for his research into the Pali texts and Buddhist tradition of Sri Lanka.

2. New Publications

- (a) Texts: 1981—*Pali Nīti Texts of Burma* (ed H. Bechert and H. Braun) and *Pannāsa Jātaka I* (apocryphal jātakas 1-25 from Burma, ed P. S. Jaini).
- (b) Translations: *Peta-Stories* (Petavatthu Commentary, tr. Ba Kyaw and Peter Masefield, 1980) and *Conditional Relations II* (Paṭṭhāna, tr. U. Nārada, 1981).

3. Reprints

- (a) 1980: Texts—*Buddhadatta's Manuals* (I. Abhidhammāvātāta and Rūpārūpavibhāga, II. Vinayavinicchaya and Uttaravinicchaya), Cūlavamsa, Samyutta Nikāya VI (Indexes), Saddhammappajotikā I-II and Sammohavinodanī (Vibhaṅga Commentary). The translation by Nāṇamoli is being prepared for publication.
Translations—*Psalm of the Early Buddhists* (Thera-theri-gāthā), *Great Chronicle of Ceylon* (Mahāvamsa) and *Kindred Sayings IV* (Samyutta Nikāya).
- (b) 1981: Texts—*Anguttara Nikāya VI* (Indexes), *Kaṅkhāvitaraṇi* and *Samantapāsādikā VII*.
Translations—*Jātaka Stories* (reprinted in 3 volumes), *Jinalāṅkāra* (ed and tr. James Gray, London 1894) and *Manual of a Mystic*.

4. Commentaries

The following have been translated and await eventual publication
Lu Pe Win—*Apadāna*, *Sutta-Nipāta* and *Thera-theri-gāthā* and Peter Masefield—*Vimānavatthu*. Win is preparing the *Mahā* and *Cūla Niddesa*, Daw Ohn the *Cariyāpiṭaka*, N. A. Jayawickrama the *Papañcasūdanī* and Jotiya Dhirasekera et al the *Sumaṅgalavilāsinī*.

5. Trade Orders

should be directed to the agents and distributors, Kegan Paul, Trench Trubner Ltd, Broadway House, Newtown Rd, Henley-on-Thames, Oxon RG9 1EN. According to Arthur Messer, who is in charge of the PTS account there, "the Society has had a busy year, with plenty

of orders coming up, quite a few reprints going through, and also new works coming along. Much of this has been made possible by Miss Horner's generosity, and the very sound financial position she bequeathed to the Society".

The Reiyukai Library

From 1st January 1982 this will be known as The International Institute for Buddhist Studies which "is intended to promote not only higher international standards of scholarship in Buddhist studies but also mutual understanding among the scholars in the relevant field of studies both in Japan and abroad".

Under the active direction of Dr Akira Yuyama, "the policy of publishing fundamental research materials from the Reiyukai itself will remain unchanged". In this connection the reader's attention is drawn to the four series pioneered by the Reiyukai Library:-

Studia Philologica Buddhica: Monograph Series

Paul M. Harrison *The Tibetan Text of the Pratyupanna-Buddha-Saṃmukhāvasthita-Samādhi-Sūtra*. Critically edited from the Derge, Narthang Peking and Lhasa editions of the Tibetan Kanjur with a Concordance and Comparative Table of Chapters in the Tibetan and Chinese versions (1978)

J. W. de Jong *Textcritical Remarks on the Bodhisattvāvadānakalpalatā* (Pallavas 42-108, 1979)

Studia Philologica Buddhica: Occasional Paper Series

Michael Hahn *Haribhatta and Gopadatta. Two Authors in the Succession of Aryaśūra. On the Rediscovery of their Jātakamālās* (1977)

Akira Yuyama and Hirofumi Toda *The Huntington Fragment F of the Saddharmapuṇḍarikāsūtra* (1977)

R. E. Emmerick *A Guide to the Literature of Khotan* (1979)

Akira Yuyama *Sanskrit Fragments of the Mahāyāna Mahāparinirvāṇasūtra I. Kōyasan Manuscript* (1981)

Bibliographia Philologica Buddhica: Series Maior

Edward Conze *The Prajñāpāramitā Literature*. Second, revised and enlarged edition (1978)

Bibliographia Philologica Buddhica: Series Minor

Helmut Eimer *Die Xerokopie des Lhasa-Kanjur*. In German and English (1977)

Hirofumi Toda *Notes on the Kashgar Manuscripts of the Saddharmapuṇḍarikāsūtra* (1977)

David A. Utz *A Survey of Buddhist Sogdian Studies* (1978)

Helmut Eimer *The Tibetan Indexes (dkar chag) to the Collected Works (bka' 'bum) of A kya gsañ 'dzin rdo rje* (1980)

For further details contact The International Institute for Buddhist Studies, 5-3-23 Toranomon, Minato-ku, Tokyo 105, Japan

OBITUARIES

I. B. Horner (30.3.1896 - 25.4.1981)

The passing of a dedicated scholar is always a matter of regret especially in the case of a prolific translator or writer. When, moreover, the person concerned has been associated and even identified with an institution, the loss becomes a tragedy.

Miss Isaline Blew Horner was born in Walthamstow (now part of Greater London) and read the Moral Sciences at Newnham College, Cambridge (1914-17). Thereafter, she occupied the positions of Librarian and Fellow. Introduced to the Rhys Davids by her relations, she contacted the American scholar, Kenneth J. Saunders, and together they visited Luzac's (apart from Probsthain's, then the only Orientalist bookshop in London) where he persuaded her to buy a copy of the Dhammapada. (Presumably his own translation—*The Buddha's Way of Virtue*—which he produced in collaboration with W. D. C. Wagsiwara, published London 1912, reprinted 1927. C. A. F. Rhys Davids' translation, *Verses on Dhamma*, appeared in the Sacred Books of the Buddhists series, PTS London 1931). She had already mastered Pali by 1942 when she succeeded Mrs Rhys Davids as Secretary of the Pali Text Society. In 1959 she succeeded W. Stede as President.

Miss Horner provided decisive and successful leadership to the PTS and energetically undertook editorial and translation work herself. Of all the many works listed in the Society's catalogue, three stand out as pre-eminent: the monumental *Book of the Discipline* (Vinaya Piṭaka—6 vols., 1938-66), the definitive *Middle Length Sayings* (Majjhima Nikāya—3 vols., 1954-59) and *Milinda's Questions* (Milindapañha—2 vols., 1963). Other translations included the Buddhavaṃsa and its Commentary, Cariyāpiṭaka, Vimānavatthu and four anthologies: (with A. K. Coomaraswamy) *The Living Thoughts of Gotama the Buddha* (London 1948), *Ten Jātaka Stories* (London 1957; repr. Bangkok 1974), *Early Buddhist Poetry* (Colombo 1963) and the Theravāda section of *Buddhist Texts Through the Ages* (Oxford 1964). Pioneer surveys comprised *Women under Primitive Buddhism* (London 1930; repr. Delhi 1973 and Amsterdam 1975) and *The Early Buddhist Theory of Man Perfected* (London 1936; repr. Amsterdam 1975 and New Delhi 1979). In addition, she contributed a number of lucidly argued papers to both academic and popular Buddhist journals some of which have been off-printed in Sri Lanka. It is a privilege to record the facts that her final original article ("The Parting Waves") and review (of Bhikkhu Bodhi's translation of the Brahmajāla Sutta and its Commentaries, *The Discourse on the All-embracing Net of Views*) appeared in this journal (IV, 3, 1979). A felicitation volume was edited by L. S. Cousins et al and appeared under the title *Buddhist Studies in Honour of I. B. Horner* (Dordrecht 1974).

For her services to Pali and Buddhist scholarship she was awarded honorary D.Litts from the University of Ceylon in 1964 and the Nālandā

Pali Institute, Patna, in 1977. Official recognition from her own country came in 1980 with the New Year Honours Award of an OBE.

Her vast collection of books on Pali and Buddhism (including the library of Lord Chalmers, a fellow scholar at Cambridge) has been bequeathed to the Faculty of Oriental Studies at Cambridge under the supervision of Mr K. R. Norman, her successor as President of the PTS.

Dr Kunst contributed an obituary to *The Times* in its issue of 12th May 1981.

She will be sorely missed by friends and colleagues alike.

R. E. W. Iggleden (11.6.13-21.3.81)

Until 1976 Hon. Secretary of the PTS and a prominent specialist in the field of Abhidhamma, Robert Iggleden finally succumbed to years of ill-health.

Born in London, he was qualified in the optical profession and highly gifted as an instrument engineer as well as being very widely versed in several other fields.

At the end of the Second World War he saw the renowned Burmese scholar, Ven. Sayadaw U Thittila, and requested him to teach Abhidhamma. Until 1952, when the Sayadaw returned to Burma after fourteen years in England, he studied the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha under him. Following that period, and at the Sayadaw's instigation, for many years he continued those classes on a revisionary basis, using the Commentaries for explanation.

In 1954, at the invitation of the then General Secretary of the Union Buddha Sāsana Council, he visited Rangoon for the WFB Conference held at Kaba Aye. He remained on in Burma for over two months after the conference, doing further Abhidhamma studies with the Sayadaw at both his private residence and on the University campus. This gave fresh material for continuing the classes on his return to England.

From 1964 Ven. U Thittila resided at his pupil's domain for two years while undertaking and completing the translation of Vibhaṅga (*The Book of Analysis*). During that time he rendered the Sayadaw every possible assistance for this first translation into English of the second book of the Abhidhamma Piṭaka, and the Sayadaw requested him to write the introduction to the work prior to preparing the MS for publication by the PTS. Having completed those tasks he also undertook the necessary proof reading and dealt with the final details for production of the volume. He also completed his short contribution to the preface in *Buddhist Psychological Ethics* (the reprint of C. A. F. Rhys David's translation of Dhamma Saṅgaṇī, PTS 1974).

In the winter of 1970-1 he led the PTS delegation to introduce to various Burmese scholars the idea of translating the Commentaries into English. The delegation was successful in interesting many bhikkhu and lay scholars in the project and at that time translators were found for almost every major Commentary.

In the second half of the 1970s, with incredible persistence, becoming slower and slower, he produced his eleven talks (written, fully charted and recorded on tape for the benefit of the British Buddhist Association) on the first chapter, "Citta", of the Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha.

He had wished that Dhammasaṅgaṇī and its Commentary, Atṭha sālinī, might have been re-translated in the terminology of *The Book of Analysis*, and that once again he could have had the opportunity to assist had Ven. U Thittila been able to undertake the translation of Sammohavinodanī, the Commentary to Vibhaṅga, thus making a vital pair of works and their Commentaries identical in terminology and consequently more readily capable of reference. He did a very great deal of preparatory work in this connection, but illness which had dogged him from 1960 onwards prevented this undertaking from proceeding any further.

Arnold Kunst (23.7.03-18.12.81)

Born in Lvov (then in Poland but incorporated into the USSR in 1945), he studied Sanskrit under Stasiak at Lvov University and under Schayer at Warsaw where, in 1934, he obtained his doctorate for a dissertation on the *Probleme der buddhistischen Logik in der Darstellung des Tattvasaṅgraha* (published by the Academy of Sciences in Cracow five years later). He occupied the positions of assistant lecturer in Indian philosophy at Lvov (1929-32), librarian at the Academy of Sciences, Warsaw (1935-38), lecturer in Indian philosophy (1945-47) and Indian religions (1964-73) at the School of Oriental and African Studies, London University; from 1972 was a visiting lecturer in Sanskrit at the Faculty of Oriental Studies, Cambridge, and was appointed review editor of the *Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society*, London, and Vice-President of the Pali Text Society. He also served as Director in the UN Department of Trusteeship and Non-self-governing Territories, New York (1947-63), during which period he functioned as Principal Secretary in missions and committees in India, Pakistan and African countries.

He edited two Sanskrit Mahāyānist texts: *Kamalalaśīla's Commentary on Śāntarakṣita's Anumānaparīkṣā of the Tattvasaṅgraha* (Mélanges Chinois et Bouddhiques, Bruges 1947) and (with E. H. Johnston) *The Vīgrahavyāvartanī of Nāgārjuna with the Author's Commentary* (ibid. 1951-reprinted, with K. Bhattacharya's translation, Delhi 1978). Apart from articles on various aspects of Indian culture, Kunst contributed papers describing "The Principle of Excluded Middle in Buddhist Philosophy" (*Rocznik Orientalistyczny*, Warsaw 1957), "The Function and Meaning of the Prasaṅga" (Proceedings of the 24th International Congress of Orientalists, Munich 1957), "Some Aspects of the Ekayāna" (*Prajñāpāramitā and Related Systems*. Studies in honor of Edward Conze, Berkeley 1977) and

"Some of the Polemics in the Laṅkāvatārasūtra" (*Buddhist Studies in honour of Walpola Rahula*, London 1980).

His final completed work was the revision of Sara (Boin) Webb's translation of the Śūraṅgamasamādhisūtra from the French edition of E. Lamotte prior to its publication by the PTS.

To quote from *The Times* obituary (23.12.81), the death of Kunst "marks the end of a fine tradition of distinguished and pioneering work in the field of Hindu and Buddhist philosophy that flourished in Poland between the two world wars". He "seemed to embody some of the finest values of the Indian traditions which he studied and taught so well. A rare blend of critical acumen with compassion marked his scholarly work as well as his personal relationships. The qualities for which he will be best remembered, a gentle and intellectually stimulating aestheticism, combined with open-mindedness and charity."

Eugeniusz Sluszkiewicz (1901-81)

Another notable Polish Indologist passed away in September 1981.

Prof. Dr Sluszkiewicz headed the Faculty of Indian Philology at Warsaw from 1953 until his retirement exactly twenty years later. Born in Jaroslav, he studied under Gawronski at Lvov, was "habilitated" by Willman-Grabowska in 1938, became Professor of Indo-European Linguistics at Toruń University from 1945 until his appointment to Warsaw. From 1958 he was the Vice-President of the Towarzystwo Przyjazzi Polsko-Indyjskiej ("Polish-Indian Friendship Society").

He wrote a popular book on Buddhism, *Buddha i jego nauka* (Warsaw 1965), contributed the articles on Buddhism and Indology to *Wielka Encyklopedia Powszechna 2* (Warsaw 1963) and *Slownik Filozofow 1* (Warsaw 1966), together with nearly 300 articles and papers to various learned journals, including "Indian Studies in Poland" for the publication, *Indian Studies Abroad* (Bombay 1964). The Festschrift *Sluszkiewicz (Ksiega pamiatkowa ku czci Eugeniusza Sluszkiewicza)*, Warsaw 1974) was edited by J. Reychman.

BOOK REVIEWS

Journal of the Pali Text Society. IX. Ed. by K. R. Norman. PTS and distributed by Routledge, Kegan Paul Ltd, London 1981. viii+207 pp. £10.

This interesting book contains a collection of articles by eminent scholars in the field of Pali studies. Fifteen contributions are included here with a wide range of subject matter though only some of them will be reviewed. As it seems natural for a reviewer to notice those essays in which he has most interest first and others later, this will be done here.

At Wat Buddha-Dhamma recently a new book has been printed containing the morning and evening chants in Pali and English and because of this Richard Gombrich's contribution "A New Theravādin Liturgy" caught the attention first. Such articles, combining scholarship and insight into Buddhist practice, are very valuable. The author gives an account of a new development in devotion in Sri Lanka where Ven. Panadure Ariyadhamma has compiled and composed a *Buddhapūjā* to the 28 Buddhas. This is described as different from existing devotions in the following four ways:

- 1) Throughout the *pūjā* the lay people chant in unison with, or after, the bhikkhu.
- 2) The bhikkhu sits with the laypeople facing the Buddha-shrine as they do. This is possible as a microphone is used.
- 3) Sinhalese is used as well as Pali.
- 4) Heightened dramatic content and emotional tone.

It is noteworthy; this last point, as the author records crowds between sixty and one hundred thousand at the performance of this *pūjā*! Obviously, from these numbers, the *pūjā* fills a great need.

The Pali-Sinhalese text is given, following a detailed account of the *pūjā*, and then the English translation. Though publications of short Pali texts were common in past Journals this is the only one here.

"Humour in Pali Literature" by Ven Walpola Rahula next caught the eye. This presents a good selection of Buddhist humour both in the Suttas and Commentaries. The Buddha's dry humour is very apparent in the Suttas quoted though the reviewer can think of several other good examples not given. Still, as the author says, his article is not intended to be comprehensive. He also remarks that many people misunderstand the Four Noble Truths and believe (wish to believe?) as a result that Buddhism is a religion of gloom and that Buddhists therefore ought to have long woeful faces. The reverse is true in both cases!

Etienne Lamotte has written on "The Garava Sutta of the Saṃyutta-nikāya and its Mahāyānist Developments." Besides the translation and setting of this Sutta he shows how the teaching contained in it was altered to suit Mahāyāna views. So that this altered version may be appreciated it is quoted from the Mahāprajñāpāramitopadeśa and the reasons for change have been thoroughly discussed. However, his discussion raises one or two important points. He says "Early Buddhism recognizes the reality of *dhammas* arisen from causes, but declares them to be impermanent, painful, empty of Me and Mine. . .", and goes on to say that this is evidence for the not-self nature of persons, while Mahāyāna is said to examine "the notion of impermanence more deeply" and thus understand the not-self nature of *dhammas*. This is always raised in Mahāyāna books as evidence for the superiority of Mahāyāna. Certainly it is a better understanding of emptiness than that of the so-called 'Hīnayāna' schools. But they are guilty of making the *dhammas* into little atom-like entities which contrasts with the Buddha's words where he has said *Sabbe dhamma anattā* (All dhammas are not self). Since not self and voidness or emptiness (*suñña*) are equivalent in meaning in the Theravāda tradition this points out that the Buddha's words in the Pali Canon and the doctrines of "Early Buddhism" do not necessarily agree.

There is another point which this essay raises. The author makes it clear that Mahāyānists aspire to the knowledge of the non-arising (of all *dhammas*). If this is so, will not the path of insight (*vipassanā*) be closed to them? There can be no insight without in-seeing arising and passing away. And if there is no insight then Enlightenment even of the despised 'hearers' (*sāvaka*), will not be possible, what to speak of a Buddha's Enlightenment! So, does this mean that in Mahāyāna only *samatha* (calm) is practised?

In an article entitled "Pali Literature in Cambodia", Ven. Dr H. Saddhatissa has given a survey with some historical details and the titles of many books and their contents in brief. He has divided these works into Biography, Works on Vinaya, Doctrinal Works, Jātaka Literature and Devotional Texts. Many interesting works are here revealed awaiting editors and translators. Not all of them would have been written in Cambodia because Thais used the Khmer script ('Khom') for manuscripts right up to this century. The large number of extra-canonical Suttas and Jātakas mentioned are remarkable, so it seems that the tendency among ancient Mahāyāna writers to ascribe their own words and ideas to the Buddha by dressing them up in Sūtra form was not absent either from the Theravāda of S.E. Asia. There are even a few *dhāraṇīs* or long *mantras* with more or less meaningless syllables. This must be the residual influence of old Cambodian Mahāyāna.

"The Buddhayāna of Indonesia: a syncretistic form of Theravāda", by Heinz Bechert, introduces the reader to one aspect of current Indonesian Buddhism. At the present time one can count six or seven distinct strains of Buddhism there, all of them now represented on a council with which the Government deals when matters of Buddhist interest arise. They are as follows: Thai-influenced Theravāda under the able leader-

ship of two Indonesian-speaking Thai Theras; Tridharma, a Chinese-based organization which is now more Buddhist than Taoist and Confucian, the Buddhist influence having come from Sri Lankan Theras; the Buddhayāna spoken of in this article centred around an Indonesian monk who has ordained in both Theravāda and Mahāyāna and wears different robes to suit different Buddhist countries; the remains of Chinese Mahāyāna as represented by a scattering of typically Chinese temples in large towns, often without any Chinese bhikkhus; in the east of Java there is the remains of Old Javanese Mahāyāna which uses an old book called Sanghyang Kamahayanikan as its scripture and practises the tantric rituals set forth in it; Balinese Agama Buddha is the sixth component, one which is even more ritualistic than the above-mentioned, being the very slight remains, in the form of a few priests with their 'Buddhist' *mantras* and ceremonies, all now enclosed in the framework of Balinese Hinduism; and last, and perhaps most incongruous, the Nichiren Shōshū (or Soka Gakkai) from Japan with their drum-beating, *mantra*-repeating sessions quite influential among the Chinese.

In his article, the author reviews the contents of a *pūṣ*-book issued by the Buddhayāna group and shows how though these *parittas* are mainly from Pali sources, others have been incorporated from the Chinese. There are, too, a few indigenous compositions in Indonesian.

Padmanabh Jain writes on "Tirthankara-prakṛti and the Bodhisattva Path" in which he interestingly compares and contrasts the paths to liberation in the Jain and Buddhist religions. Many of the virtues to be practised and fulfilled are the same in both traditions but there is an outstanding difference in that in the former there is no point at which a person resolves upon Enlightenment. Rather, such a resolve, which all Bodhisattvas must make, would be regarded as an unwholesome action. "The Jains have maintained that the bartering (called *midāna*) of one's virtuous deeds for the attainment of supernatural powers of rebirths in heaven, not to speak of Tirthankarahood, is the greatest obstacle on the Path of salvation." Perhaps not the greatest obstacle but it could certainly be one!

For those who are interested in Abhidhamma there is a solid contribution from Lance Cousins entitled "The Paṭṭhāna and the Development of the Theravādin Abhidhamma". If one's interest lies rather in words then there are four essays: "The Ghost Word DVIHITIKA and the Description of Famines in Early Buddhist Literature" (O. von Hinüber); "Keci 'Some' in the Pali Commentaries" (I. B. Horner); "Devas and Adhidevas in Buddhism" (K.R. Norman); and "A Further Note on Pali *Gotrabhū* (D. Seyfort Rugg). Historical studies are also included: "The Theravādins and East India according to the Canonical Texts" (André Bareau); "Fa-Hsien and Buddhist Texts in Ceylon" (J. W. de Jong), and "Some Problems of the Later Pali Literature" (A. K. Warder).

Finally a rather disappointing essay, "The Philosophy of History in Early Buddhism", is the work of D. J. Kalupahana. Though he quotes

extensively he has overlooked the real reason why the early Buddhists wrote or left behind no history or biography in connected form. The earliest Buddhist, the Buddha himself, nowhere relates his own life story, only fragments of which emerge here and there usually to illustrate some Dhamma-teaching. The Buddha and the other Arahants, who constituted the most prominent of the early Buddhists, had lost the idea of the world revolving about themselves, the opposite to the conception of ordinary people. There is no self to tell a story about! And they live all the time in the present, neither mulling over the past, nor anticipating the future, so how would the past, in the form of history, be valuable? When one thinks about it, when have human beings ever learnt anything from the past? And how is it possible to do so? Even when the memory 'resurrects' the past it is as a *present* state of mind.

Phra Khantipālo Thera

Buddhism in Ceylon and Studies on Religious Syncretism in Buddhist Countries. Report on a Symposium in Göttingen. Ed. Heinz Bechert. Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Göttingen 1978.

This book is a collection of academic research papers prepared for a symposium sponsored by the German Academy of Sciences in Göttingen on 12-14 July 1974 and organised by its Committee for Buddhist Studies. It is heartening to learn that this learned German body has such a permanent committee (it was formed in 1972) and the German subtitle (Symposien zur Buddhismusforschung, I) is also promising in that it implies further Buddhist symposia will take place. If so, it will show the vitality of Buddhist studies in the Göttingen Academy which have an almost unbroken tradition going back to the times of Hermann Oldenberg.

The Symposium was apparently carefully prepared, papers circulated in advance and most results of their discussion then incorporated into their published version. Some differing views are reported on in the editor's introduction.

The contributions are divided into three sections, the first one dealing with "Buddhist Literature in Ceylon". It starts with K. R. Norman's (Cambridge) "The role of Pāli in early Sinhalese Buddhism" which first examines the problem of the influence of Sinhalese on the language of the Pāli Canon during the time from its introduction into Sri Lanka in the middle of the 3rd century B.C. until it was committed to writing under the king Vaṭṭagāmiṇi (29-17 B.C.). The author and the editor differ to a degree on this matter, but the author's statement that there is no appreciable difference between the Pāli of the time of its introduction into the island and the Pāli in which the Canon was written down is accepted by the editor as a basis for further research. The article goes on to examine the problems associated with the language of commentaries, chronicles and writings of dissident sects. In the course of his philological investigations the author expresses his views on some questions important

for Theravāda Buddhists, for example that, contrary to the Sinhalese tradition, Pāli was not originally Māgadhī and therefore the language of the Buddha. He assumes that the inhabitants of the areas where the Buddha preached spoke a number of (slightly) different dialects, including Old Māgadhī, and that the Buddha probably varied his own dialect to suit his audience—a most plausible suggestion. He also says that there is no evidence for any substantial additions to the Canon after its arrival in Sri Lanka. He further discusses the problem of language used by the schismatic Abhayagirivāsins and touches upon the whole question of Vetulyakas, both problems needing additional investigation. A more exhaustive treatment of the problems relating to the language of the Pāli Canon was reserved for a special conference in 1976 whose results have been published in the same series as this book.

The next contribution, "On the Tradition of Pāli Texts in India, Ceylon and Burma", by O. v. Hinüber (Mainz) deals with the problems of the application of textual criticism to Pāli sources in which there is sometimes a big time gap between their redaction and the available written record. Thus practically no known manuscript of the Pāli Canon is older than 400 years. The author distinguishes three stages of the Pāli text tradition: (1) the original text of the Pāli Canon as fixed in the first century B.C., (2) commentaries of the 5th-6th century and (3) subcommentaries. He shows how even the subcommentaries and their interpretation influenced the wording of the canonical texts. He sees his article as only a first step towards a history of the Pāli text tradition. Next V. Stache-Rosen (Bangalore) reports in "Das Upāli-paripṛcchā-sūtra. Ein Text zur buddhistischen Ordensdisziplin" on a Chinese Vinaya text. Practically all its parts have word for word parallels in the Pāli Vinaya, although not as a continuous text. The authoress is inclined to regard it as a canonical text of the Abhayagirivāsins, but does not rule out its possible Indian origin. A. Pieris (Sri Lanka) presents a paper on "The Colophon to the Paramatthamañjūsā and the discussion on the date of Ācariya Dhammapāla". The most prolific compiler of commentaries after Buddhaghosa is placed by him in the latter half of the 6th or in the early 7th century, although there are still a few unclarified points around this problem. R. Gombrich's (Oxford) illustrated discussion of "A Sinhalese Cloth Painting of the Vessantara Jātaka" from the 18th century precedes the last paper of this section on "Mañjuśrī-bhāṣita-Citrakarmasāstra: A Mahāyānistīc Śilpaśāstra from Sri Lanka" by H. Ruelius (Göttingen) describing and analysing a 14th century palm leaf manuscript.

The second section entitled "Buddhism and Society in Sri Lanka" comprises three papers: "Kingship, the Sangha and the Process of Legitimation in Anurādhapura Ceylon: An Interpretative Essay" by B. L. Smith (Northfield, Minn.), E. Sarkisyanz (Heidelberg) "Fragen zum Problem des chronologischen Verhältnisses des buddhistischen Modernismus in Ceylon und Birma" and C. H. B. Reynolds (London) "Religion and Social Position in British Ceylon".

The third section entitled "The Comparative View of Religious Syncretism in Buddhist Countries" comprises ten papers: S. Lienhard

(Stockholm) "Religions-synkretismus in Nepal", J. Ensink (Groningen) "Siva-Buddhism in Java and Bali", R. K. Heinemann (Geneva) "Buddhistisch-schintoistischer Synkretismus in Struktur und Praxis des Tempels Rinnōji in Nikkō, Japan", H. Bechert, A. Das Gupta and G. Roth (Göttingen) "Hindu Elements in the Religion of the Buddhist Baruas and Chakmas in Bengal", H. Bechert "On the Popular Religion of the Sinhalese", K. Hausherr (Heidelberg) "Katagarama: Das Heiligtum im Dschungel Südost-Ceylons—aus geographischer Sicht", R. Gombrich (ed. and tr.) "Kosala-Bimba-Vaṇṇanā" (a medieval Pali text from Sri Lanka which gives a legendary account of how the practice of making images of the Buddha began), H. Ruelius "Netrapatiṣṭhāpana—eine singhalesische Zeremonie zur Weihe von Kultbildern" (which describes the rituals surrounding the consecration of the Buddha statues and the painting in of their eyes)—a controversial paper which provoked a response from R. Gombrich under the title "The Buddha's Eye, the Evil Eye, and Dr Ruelius". The collection closes with the summary of the contribution "Der Paritta-Dienst in Sri Lanka" by P. Schalk (Göteborg) who had published a book on the subject in 1972. He shows that *paritta* is not just a rite of exorcism, but that there are four types of it which, far from belonging only to the "popular" level of Buddhist practice (as one would conclude from Bechert's contribution), are intended to assist also in the higher achievements of meditational absorptions with the goal of Nibbāna in mind.

Karel Werner

(Despite being commissioned for the *Review*, the above notice was inadvertently printed in its full version in *Buddhist Quarterly* 13, 1-2, 1981, the journal of the British Mahābodhi Society/London Buddhist Vihāra. For that reason the review of the second and third sections of the book have been abridged here.)

Tekster til Buddhisten. Selected and translated by Frede Möller-Kristensen. Gyldendal, Copenhagen 1980. 104 pp. Illustrated. D.Kr.68.50

This attractive volume forms part of the series, Religionspaedagogiske Studier, which comprise anthologies of the world's sacred texts.

The selection of representative Pali texts is taken primarily from the Vinaya Piṭaka and Majjhima and Samyutta Nikāyas and have not before been translated into Danish. Unfortunately, only the Cūla Mālunkhaya Sutta (M 63) appears in full. The texts are arranged under four chapter headings: Buddha, Laeren (Dhamma), Munke og laegfolk ("Monks and laypeople") and Buddhisten og andre religioner ("Buddhism and other religions"). The last-named section relies on quotations from Nārada Mahāthera and Lynn de Silva as found in, respectively, *Moses Jung Relations among Religions Today* (Leiden 1963) and S. J. Samartha *Dialogue between Men of Living Faiths* (Geneva 1971).

The translator is Head of the Oriental Department in The Royal Library, Copenhagen, a contributor to Vol. II of the Critical Pāli

Dictionary and a member of the Council of the Pali Text Society. He has contributed the section on Buddhism to the *Illustreret Religionshistorie* II (1968), "Buddhismens Oprindelse" to *Buddha's Veje* (1970) and "Om buddhistisk litteratur" to the *Verdens Litteratur Historie* I (1972).

The Theravāda tradition is treated in a positive and reliable manner and is probably aimed at secondary schools, teacher training colleges and similar institutions. Being the only work of its kind in print, it is therefore a welcome addition to Danish Buddhist literature.

Jörgen Sodemann and Russell Webb

Die Erzählstoffe des Mūlasarvāstivādinaya. Jampa Losang Panglung. Studia Philologica Buddhica Monograph Series III, The Reiyukai Library, Tokyo 1981. xxxv+313 pp.

Because the Pali Vinaya was the first corpus of its kind in the Buddhist world to receive the attention of critical Western analysts—philological, historical, sociological and theological—and belonged to a major living lineage, no doubt explains the vast literature that resulted, apart from its complete textual romanisation and English translation at the hands of the PTS.

The Sanskrit Vinayas, notably those of the Sarvāstivādins and Mūlasarvāstivādins (the latter inherited by the Tibetan Vajrayāna), are no less important for the information they provide on early Buddhist developments in doctrine and folklore. And yet, despite the pioneer work of Waldschmidt, N. Dutt et al and the Serie Roma Orientale, and the fact that complete editions exist in Tibetan and Chinese, very little exegetical material has appeared in the Western vernaculars. In English, the only full-length study is A. C. Banerjee's analysis of *Sarvāstivāda Literature* (Calcutta 1957, repr. 1979).

The present work purports to provide a complete analysis of the author's ancestral "Code of Discipline", insofar as its popular literary component part is concerned, and represents a revision of his doctoral dissertation accepted by Munich University in 1979. The stories (*jātakas*, *avadānas* etc.) in each of the 22 chapters of the Mūlasarvāstivādin Vinaya are summarised, section by section, and then cross-referred to modern editions or translations of these items which are elucidated in an exhaustive bibliography. At the end of the book useful tables illustrate the parallel versions of these stories in the Pali Jātaka (tr. E. B. Cowell et al), Bodhisattvāvadānakalpalatā, Jātakamālā (tr. J. S. Speyer), Mahāvastu (tr. J. J. Jones), Rāṣṭrapālapiṭṭhā (tr. J. Ensink), the Khotanese Jātakastava (tr. M. J. Dresden), the Taishō edition of the Chinese Canon and E. Chavannes' voluminous collection of stories from the Chinese, *Cinq cents contes et apologues*.

Although Anton von Schiefner had translated all the "Indische Erzählungen" from the Kanjur for St. Petersburg Academy's *Bulletin*

over a century ago (English tr. *Tibetan Tales*), with S. Julien producing the Chinese recension of *Les Avadānas* in French translation even earlier, this present compilation undoubtedly represents the most comprehensive survey of its kind.

RBW

Buddhist Studies. Selected Essays of J. W. de Jong. Ed. Gregory Schopen. Asian Humanities Press—a division of Lancaster-Miller Publishers, Berkeley, California 1979 (publication date 15.4.81). ix+717 pp. \$ 35.00.

Although in recent years and notably in West Germany the *kleine schriften* of scholars have been collected and published in substantial volumes, it is rare to see a tome of such writings appear during the subject's lifetime. It therefore denotes the high regard in which his authoritative contributions to the field of Buddhism are held that an outsize *selection* (!) of Prof. de Jong's essays and reviews should be reprinted at the height of his distinguished career.

Jan Willem de Jong was born 1921 in Leiden, studied Sanskrit, Chinese and Japanese at the University there (one of the most reputable in Europe for Oriental studies) 1941-45 and obtained his doctorate four years later for a translation of *Cinq chapitres de la Prasannapadā* (i.e. chapters 18-22 of Candrakīrti's commentary to Nāgārjuna's *Mūlamadhyamakārikā* published by Paul Geuthner, Paris 1949). From 1953 he was Lecturer and three years later became the first Professor of Buddhism and Tibetan at Leiden. During this period he also worked in the Kern (research) Institute. His vast contribution to academic journals issued by the major centres of Oriental studies in Europe, Japan and the USA are listed chronologically on pp. 663-717 of the volume under review. With F. B. J. Kuiper (the successor to J. P. Vogel in the Chair of Sanskrit, also at Leiden), he founded and edited, from 1957, the *Indo-Iranian Journal* (and Monograph Series) which deals with the philology, religions and history of India and Iran during the pre-Islamic period. In 1967 De Jong was appointed Head of the Department of South Asia and Buddhist Studies (and Dean of the Faculty of Oriental Studies) at The Australian National University in Canberra.

A former student of his has selected and arranged nearly seventy of his mentor's writings into the following seven categories: General Studies, Buddhist Authors, Pāli Literature, Sanskrit Hinayāna Literature, Mahāyāna Sūtra Literature, Śāstra Literature and Tantric Literature. As can be seen, therefore, the entire range of Indian Buddhist thought is evenly covered using the mediums of English and French and it is to be hoped that a companion volume incorporating De Jong's contributions to the fields of Chinese, Tibetan and Mongolian Buddhist studies will soon appear.

Obviously the personal preferences of readers inhibits the highlighting here of any of the published items. Suffice it to say that, by elucidating

the data contained in the Buddhist sacred literature, whether by a philological—or historical—textual methodology, the papers contain a mine of information which would prove difficult to come by elsewhere. The publishers deserve our thanks for producing such a pioneer work and their subject our gratitude for making such an enlightening and prolific contribution to knowledge.

RBW

The sacred texts of Buddhism. Australian National University Library. Bibliographical Series No. 1. Canberra 1981. vii+60 pp. Aus. \$ 9.00.

It is always encouraging to hear of increased activity in the Oriental field, especially in those regions where such interest has been of comparatively recent origin. Of all the institutions where such activity has been organised along carefully structured lines, The Australian National University undoubtedly leads the field "down under", due in large measure to the dynamism and sustained endeavours of the Head of the Department of South Asian and Buddhist Studies, Prof. J. W. de Jong who has, appropriately, contributed the Introduction to the work under review.

On the occasion of the 28th International Congress of Orientalists, held in Canberra at the beginning of 1971, an exhibition was held in the University for which a catalogue was prepared. It is from that work that the present listing has been compiled, largely by Ajit Kumar Ray, the Senior Librarian of South Asian Studies.

The holdings of the University (including four held by the National Library of Australia) are allocated under three main headings: 1. Tripiṭaka (Pāli in Burmese, Devanāgarī, Khmer, Roman, Sinhalese and Thai editions with Khmer, Sinhalese and Japanese translations; Chinese in Japanese, Korean and Tangut editions; Tibetan and Mongolian editions) and Pāli Commentaries (mainly Burmese, Roman and Sinhalese editions). 2. Mahāyāna Texts: Sūtras and Śāstras (comprising all the main compositions in the form of Sanskrit editions with English, French or German translations). 3. Tantrayāna Texts (comprising a dozen Sanskrit or Tibetan editions). Each section and text incorporates detailed historical and publication information which assures the value of this brochure as a work of reference.

An Appendix includes selected bibliographies and dictionaries, even mentioning the dates of most of the contributors but rather surprisingly omitting the years of decease of Hackmann (1935) and Edgerton (1963).

In short, an attractively produced work of perennial value.

RBW

Faith and Knowledge in Early Buddhism. Jan T. Ergardt. E. J. Brill, Leiden 1977. xii + 182 pp. Gld 48.00

Western religion revolves around the two poles of faith and knowledge, the author maintains, and he asks whether this is the case also with Buddhism. He tackles the problem in a most thoroughgoing fashion by analyzing the relevant passages which deal with the Arahant, the one who is an aspirant to or has achieved the *summum bonum* of Buddhism, *vimukti* and/or *nibbāna*. He finds four different "formulations" of the Arahant situation giving an answer to what it means to be in that state, and how it is achieved, together with what rôle faith, *saddhā*, and knowledge *ñāṇa*, play in it. It is apparent that our general concept of faith cannot be equated with *saddhā* or *śraddhā* in Sanskrit. In the Indian context are included elements of what we would call knowledge, and its importance "is affective and conative" (p. 171).

The author confines himself to scrutinizing the 152 *suttas* of the Majjima Nikāya of the Pāli Canon as containing the most authentic and earliest formulation of the Buddhist doctrine. This Canon is generally thought to be older and more complete than the Sanskrit Canon. It also provides a more "thorough description of real life (of the Buddhist monk aspiring to the *summum bonum*) as taught by the Buddha" himself (p. 149). The author is not concerned with the metaphysical aspects of the Buddha's teachings in which the Japanese, for instance, take such an interest and which revolve around silence and "emptiness" or *suññatā*. It is, of course, debatable whether this is a wise decision inasmuch as the Buddha's silence as recorded in the scriptures, speaks volumes and may be the capstone of his teachings.

There is no doubt, the recognition and thorough grasp of *anattā* is a requisite for *vimutti*. It implies non-identification of one's self or I with perceptual and conceptual reality in which we are normally immersed. We can hardly escape the conclusion that the self or I is noumenal though it may not be permissible from the Buddhist point of view which seems simplistic until we arrive at the point of silence of the Buddha. It seems to me that the metaphysical implications of what the Buddha said cannot be ignored. It legitimizes the development of the philosophical aspects of Mahāyānism. From a conversation with one very knowledgeable high-ranking *bhikkhu* in Thailand I gathered that even in the ethically oriented Hinayāna or Theravāda the metaphysical tendency is acknowledged while lacking in popular and *sāmaṇero* Buddhism.

Be that as it may, our author has done a magnificent job in highlighting all passages in the Majjima Nikāya, comparing and reconciling them, in a way, in order to get a rounded-out picture of the religious life of an Arahant or the Buddhist monk in general. His observations on the comprehension of "ordinary people" not associated with the Sangha, is very brief.

The *anattā* doctrine he takes as an anchor concept. *Anattā* must be made a matter of experienced reality and intuitive knowledge. But while

the Vedāntic Upaniṣads arrive at a positive for the self or I, the Buddha vanquishes it altogether. Strangely he leaves the phenomenal world intact and untransformed as an occasion for the practice of good conduct, *sīla*, and the overcoming of suffering, *dukkha*, by getting rid of thirst or *taṇhā*. Meditation or *samādhi* is necessary for reaching the goal of arahantship, as we would expect. The author has pointed out further important nuances in the steps toward *nibbāna* conditioned by knowledge, *ñāṇa*, and understanding, *paññā*, and the envisaging of the goal. Warding off the "influxes", *khiṇāsava*s, of bad thoughts is also accounted an important step. Particularly interesting is the role knowledge plays in the actual attainment of release or freedom, *vimutti*. The one who has attained it is at the same time aware that he is free. We may conclude that no one has truly become free or has obtained *nibbāna* who is not fully conscious of it. We are, thus, again reminded of the Vedāntic *summum bonum* of *sat-cid-ānanda*, being, consciousness, and love. To proclaim having reached the goal is no idle boast, but is in the nature of joy over having shed all fetters and nullified rebirth.

This book is valuable in that it throws light also on other concepts, such as *kamma* or *karma* in the Buddhist sense. It clarifies the difficult phrase *parinibhāyati*, "he attains full *nibbāna*", and many others. *Faith and Knowledge in Early Buddhism* may be a bit difficult for the lay student of religions, but for the student of Buddhism and the comparative religionist it is indispensable. He may have to abandon preconceived notions attached to concepts of faith and knowledge if used to interpret the psychological attitude of Buddhism which lacks some of the basic concepts with which Western religions operate, and may come away with a deeper understanding of Buddhism and its elusive *nibbāna*. The author of this volume deserves praise for a thorough and unbiassed study based on the original sources that can only bring us closer to a true comprehension of the Buddha's teachings.

Kurt F. Leidecker

The Only Way to Deliverance. R. L. Soni. Prajñā Press, Boulder 1980. 117 pp. \$ 5.95

It was the Buddha himself who said that the Satipaṭṭhāna Sutta is the only way to liberation or *nibbāna*. But any reasonable person who has been shown the path must come to the same conclusion. Dr Soni has made the task easier with his lucid explanations and a number of superbly executed diagrams.

After a brief discussion of the two versions of the Satipaṭṭhāna Sutta, Dr Soni prepares the reader for the "procedure of discipline" for establishing "mindfulness". Mindfulness is, of course, directed toward the basic Buddhist realities of impermanence and insubstantiality of things and selves, and the elimination of suffering. But since the I or self seems necessarily involved in any endeavour to grasp reality in the Buddhist sense, the problem becomes one of method. For, liberation consists in the very abandoning of the concept of I, in complete detachment.

How to achieve this distancing and vanishing of the self is a delicate and difficult matter, and reading this *sutta* without preparation and guidance may lead to frustrations. One may quarrel with the author's use of "transcendental" and wish to substitute for it "transcendent"; but the "spiritual path" outlined is well and persuasively presented. Some aspects are, without doubt, beyond verbal explanation and definition and insight appears to be the only approach which avoids possible pitfalls.

It is a commendable feature of Dr Soni's treatment of the Satipaṭṭhāna Sutta (of which he offers an abridged version) that he expands his explanations into a perceptive discussion of the Four Noble Truths, the *paṭicca-samuppāda* or the doctrine of "Dependent Origination" which he interprets as "The Processing of Life", and the "fetters" which hold a person down, morally and spiritually.

The value of this book is further enhanced by a full translation with notes of the Mahā Satipaṭṭhāna Sutta, a useful glossary and a short bibliography.

Whoever is interested in "Sorrow and the Way to its End" as the Buddha phrased it, be it from a psychological and a practical point of view, not forgetting its intellectual foundation, will be more than benefitted by first reading this insight-informed book by an author who himself practises the compassionate path of the Buddha.

Kurt F. Leidecker

Theravāda Meditation: The Buddhist Transformation of Yoga
Winston L. King. Pennsylvania State University Press 1980. viii + 166pp.
\$10.00

This is an excellent study of a subject which has long needed a more careful analysis. Although much literature abounds on Zen and other later forms of Buddhist meditation, a definitive text on Theravāda practice is welcome. The book may not replace the classic work of Nyanaponika (1962) but it adds greatly to a better understanding of Theravāda meditational theory and technique.

The author discusses his topic in seven chapters. His central argument is that the traditional bifurcation of meditation into the two 'ways' of *sati* (mindfulness) and *samādhi* (concentration) reflects the historical links Buddhist practice has with the Yogic-Brahmanic tradition. Thus, he goes on to demonstrate, the aim of *samādhi* (concentration leading to calmness) is distinctly Yogic, but the aim of *sati* (or *vipassanā*—mindfulness leading to insight) is something specifically Buddhist. He sees this tension in such contradictory passages as M I 121 and I 242, where devotees are instructed on the one hand to work hard at their meditation (reflective of the Hindu ascetic model of concentration) and on the other simply to be mindful. King labels this as 'Gotama's acceptance—rejection of contemporary spiritual techniques' (p. 6). This discussion leads him to conclude that the way of *samādhi* (or at least part of it) is something

inherited from the Indian tradition from which the Buddha and his followers came, but that instead of rejecting this method, the Buddha incorporated it as an adjunct to his own evolving way of *vipassanā*. In this regard, King rightly points out that although only through *sati-vipassanā* can Nirvāṇa be finally attained, nevertheless *samādhi* can be harnessed to reinforce the Buddhist world-view of the evanescent, non-integral, dissatisfying nature of everything. This is the 're-yoganization' of an original Brahmanic technique aimed at a monistic experience to a more existential Buddhist purpose. Thus the mind is quietened and sharpened by the concentration required in *samādhi* and is better able to achieve mindfulness (*sati*). There is a considerable qualitative affinity, therefore, between the states of concentration achieved in *samādhi* and the results of *sati*.

In a final interesting chapter, King reviews contemporary forms of Theravāda practice in Burma (based partly, one presumes, on research he conducted there in 1971). Here he suggests that because *samādhi* needs both time and the right environment to be meaningful, it is largely confined to the monasteries. He then provides a superlative survey of the various ways in which *sati* is now taught. These range from the relatively orthodox and harmonious *satipaṭṭhāna* (mindfulness) method of Mahāsi Sayadaw, to the quite radical system of Sunlungukyaung Sayadaw, based as it is on intense concentration and rough, forced breathing.

The main contribution of this book is its thorough critique of the relevant passages in the Sutta Piṭaka and in Buddhaghosa's commentaries, combined with a successful attempt at showing the relevance of this classical tradition in the modern Theravāda Buddhist world.

Bruce Matthews

Love and Sympathy in Theravāda Buddhism. Harvey B. Aronson.
Motilal Banarsidass, Delhi 1980. 127 pp. Rs 45.

The author is currently Assistant Professor of Religious Studies specialising in Buddhism at the University of Virginia in Charlottesville. He spent two years in India in 1971/2 studying the philosophy and meditational practices of Theravāda, Mahāyāna and Tantric Buddhism and during that time met Satyanarayan Goenka-ji the meditation teacher who greatly impressed him. The author found that he placed considerable emphasis on love and helpfulness to others and he noted that this was in contrast to the idea of many Western scholars that Theravāda Buddhism is cold and aloof. In this book, the author seeks to show the place which an attitude of concern for others has in the Buddhism of the Theravāda and he turns to the Buddha's discourses and their commentaries to show this fully. In the Preface, Professor Aronson says that this book grew out of his study of works on religious love by Søren Kierkegaard and Martin Buber and he was influenced by a lecture he heard delivered by Dr Richard Alpert on the Asian religious traditions and complementary material on love in these faiths. The initial phases of his study were made in India where Goenka-ji showed the author the riches of the Theravāda. Professor Aronson mentions the assertions of two Western

scholars, Winston King and Melford Spiro, which state that, "...the normative ethic of Theravāda Buddhism is one of withdrawal from society and abstention from social involvement." A detailed critique of this view is found in Chapter Six of this book and the author states that he is concerned with the motives to social action as well as the psychological and sociological import of the teachings on love, sympathy and the sublime attitudes.

Chapter One shows that concern for others' welfare and well-being was the prime motive which Gotama the Buddha had in arising and coming to be and that all who "establish themselves in the paths, fruitions and heavens depending on the teaching" will be the beneficiaries. These included a multitude of species (p. 5) and there is an interesting section of this chapter on "Receiving gifts out of sympathy." Chapter Two deals with examples of specific kindnesses, i.e. Mahākassapa, Nakula's mother, the kindness of monks who give up anger and quotations from the Gradual Sayings as well (p. 13/14). A section deals with sympathy as an antidote to hostility (pp. 18-20). Chapter Three concerns the loving mind. "One who sustains a loving mind for even the duration of a snap of the fingers is called a monk (bhikkhu)." In the Smaller Snap Commentary the Buddha tells Ananda that there are in his teaching as many causes for "breathing easily" as there are paths in the ocean. P. 31 details the loving activities of disciples and gives the six conditions which will lead to gain i.e. offering loving physical, verbal and mental activities to fellow practitioners, both openly and unbeknown to others, sharing alms with fellow practitioners, being endowed with correct conduct and possession of the view that will ultimately lead to the destruction of suffering. Chapter Four details the benefits of love (p. 56) while Chapter Five is devoted to the sublime attitudes, loving kindness, compassion, sympathetic joy and equanimity and to the order of development. Chapter Six deals more specifically with "even-mindedness" or equanimity and gives a detailed critique of the views of Winston King and Melford Spiro regarding "kammatic Buddhism" and "Nibbānic Buddhism"—the author seeks to show that there is no unbridgeable gap between the two. "While it is true that the teachings on liberation from rebirth are considered more profound than those on achieving high rebirth, the former are not totally distinct from the latter. Practitioners of insight... are still very much working within the laws of cause and effect. The cultivation of virtuous activities (*kamma*) ensures good rebirth, but more importantly creates the nexus within which a practitioner can cultivate concentration and insight in the present."

Useful and detailed notes follow and there is a learned bibliography, followed by an English-Pali Glossary and a note of Proper Names and Discourses. There is also a comprehensive Index. A useful and unusual book which does much to eliminate the view that the "Hinayāna" is a very narrow basis of the Buddha's teaching, being selfish and self-centred. This book shows that loving concern for others' welfare is one of the keynotes of the teaching of Lord Buddha and that in protecting oneself one also protects others as well as vice versa!

Barbara Noll

PALI BUDDHIST REVIEW

INDEXES

VOLUMES I-V: 1976-80

Articles, translations, titles of	Vol.	Page
Aggregates and Clinging Aggregates Bhikkhu Bodhi	I	91
Analogy of Jivān-mukta in Vedanta with the Arahant in Pali Buddhism, The Bhikkhu Nāṇajivako	IV	71
Analysis of the Sela Sutta of the Sutta Nipāta, An L. P. N. Perera	IV	66
Anicca Arvind Sharma	IV	16
Buddha's Advice to Bāhiya, The John D. Ireland	II	159
Buddhist Publication Society	I	53
Buddhist Sutta, The John D. Ireland	I	17
Cetovimutti, Paññāvimutti and Ubhatobhāgavimutti Lily De Silva	III	118
Concept of Iddhi in Early Buddhist Thought, The Harold W. French	II	42
Critical Analysis of the Sutta Nipāta N. A. Jayawickrama	I	75, 136
Critical Analysis of the Sutta Nipāta N. A. Jayawickrama	II	14, 86, 141
Critical Analysis of the Sutta Nipāta N. A. Jayawickrama	III	3, 45, 100
Critical Pali Dictionary, A Sukomal Chaudhuri	II	69
Dhammapada tr. Ven. B. Ananda Maitreya	I	57, 125
Dhammapada tr. Ven. B. Ananda Maitreya	II	1, 69
Dhammapada in the West, The Russell Webb	III	20
Discourse on Old Age, The (tr. of the Jāra Sutta in Sutta Nipāta) Bhikkhu Khantipālo	IV	49
Distinction between Sopādhiseṣa and Nirupādhiseṣa Nirvāṇa, The Arvind Sharma	III	114
Does the "Cessation of the World" entail the Cessation of Emotions? The Psychology of the Arahant Nathan Katz	IV	53
Fragment of the Nidānasūtra, A, tr. John M. Cooper	V	53
Karma—The Ripening Fruit Bhikkhu Nāṇajivako	I	19
Khuddakapāṭha, intr. and tr. R. C. Childers	I	8
Kommission für Buddhistische Studien, Göttingen	V	48
Kosambī Suttas, The John D. Ireland	I	105
Literary Activity in Pali N. A. Jayawickrama	V	76
Lotus as a Symbol in the Pali Tradition, The Carl Olson	V	27
Meaning of "Abhidhamma" in the Pali Canon, The Terry C. Muck	V	12
Meaning of the Word "Tathāgata", The Bhikkhu Bodhi	III	65
Misconceptions about Buddhism Rada Ivekovic	III	30
More on Suññatā David Evans	II	109
Mūlapariyāya Sutta, tr. Nāṇamoli Thera	V	1

		Vol.	Page
New Approaches to Buddhism: The Hard Way	Bhikkhu Nāṇajivako	V	59
Note on the Navaṅga, A	John D. Ireland	II	106
Note on Solitude/Inwardness	Malcolm Hudson	I	103
Notions of Citta, Attā and Attabhāva in the Pāli Exegetical Writings, The	Aloysius Pieris	IV	5
Pāli Buddhist Studies in the West: Austria	Russell Webb	III	35
Czechoslovakia	"	IV	86
Denmark	"	II	162
France	"	III	146
Germany	"	II	114
Italy	"	III	84
Poland	"	V	39
Sweden	"	IV	28
U. K.	"	I	169
U.S.A. and Canada	John F. Bardisban	II	55
Yugoslavia	Russell Webb	V	89
		I	55
Pāli Buddhist Union			
Pāli Grammar and Composition for Beginners, serialised pull-out supplement	Ven. B. Ananda Maitreya	II ff. (centre)	
		I	51
Pāli Text Society		IV	25
Pāli Text Society's Centenary, The	H. Saddhātissa	IV	50
Parting Waves, The	I. B. Horner		
Psychological Causality in Early Buddhism	Rune E. A. Johansson	III	22
Stanzas of Victory (Thera-theri-gāthā) tr.	Bhikkhu Khantipālo	III	1, 41, 97
Stanzas of Victory (Thera-theri-gāthā) tr.	Bhikkhu Khantipālo	IV	1
Studies in the Jinacarita	Sukomal Chaudhuri	V	23
Suññatā—Anattā	Rada Iveković	I	164
Telakaṭṭhagāthā, intr. and tr.		II	127
Way of Buddhist Meditation, The	Bhikkhu Nāṇajivako	V	93
Way to Nirvāṇa according to the Dhammapada, The	L. M. Joshi	V	30
What is Pāli?	P. Wimalawamsa and L. P. N. Perera	I	3

Authors

Ananda Maitreya, Ven. B. (tr.) Dhammapada	I	57, 125
" " " "	II	1, 69
Ananda Maitreya, Ven. B. Pāli Grammar and Composition for Beginners, pull-out supplement from	II	(centre)
Bardisban, John F. Pāli Buddhist Studies in the West—U.S.A. and Canada	II	55

		Vol.	Page
Bodhi, Bhikkhu	Aggregates and Clinging Aggregates	I	91
Bodhi, Bhikkhu	The Meaning of the Word "Tathāgata"	III	65
Chaudhuri, Sukomal	A Critical Pāli Dictionary	II	69
Chaudhuri, Sukomal	Studies in the Jinacarita	V	23
Childers, R. C.	Khuddakapāṭha (intr. and tr.)	I	8
Cooper, John M.	A Fragment of the Nidānasūtra (tr.)	V	53
De Silva, Lily	Cetovimutti, Paññāvimutti and Ubhatobhāgavimutti	III	118
Evans, David	More on Suññatā	II	109
French, Harold W.	The Concept of Iddhi in Early Buddhist Thought	II	42
Horner, I. B.	The Parting Waves	IV	50
Hudson, Malcolm	Note on Solitude/Inwardness	I	103
Ireland, John D.	The Buddha's Advice to Bāhiya	II	159
Ireland, John D.	The Buddhist Sutta	I	17
Ireland, John D.	The Kosambi Suttas	I	105
Ireland, John D.	A Note on the Navaṅga	II	106
Iveković, Rada	Misconceptions about Buddhism	III	30
Iveković, Rada	Suññatā—Anattā	I	164
Jayawickrama, N. A.	A Critical Analysis of the Sutta Nipāta	I	75, 136
" " "	" " "	II	14, 86, 141
" " "	" " "	III	3, 45, 100
Jayawickrama, N. A.	Literary Activity in Pāli	V	76
Johansson, Rune E. A.	Psychological Causality in Early Buddhism	III	22
Joshi, L. M.	The Way to Nirvāṇa according to the Dhammapada	V	30
Khantipālo, Bhikkhu	tr. The Discourse on Old Age	IV	49
Khantipālo, Bhikkhu	tr. Stanzas of Victory	III	1, 41, 97
" "	" "	IV	1
Katz, Nathan	Does the "Cessation of the World" entail the Cessation of Emotions? The Psychology of the Arahant	IV	53
Muck, Terry C.	The Meaning of "Abhidhamma" in the Pāli Canon	V	12
Nāṇajivako, Bhikkhu	The Analogy of Jīvan-mukta in Vedānta with the Arahant in Pāli Buddhism	IV	71
Nāṇajivako, Bhikkhu	Karma—The Ripening Fruit	I	19
Nāṇajivako, Bhikkhu	New Approaches to Buddhism: the Hard Way	V	59
Nāṇajivako, Bhikkhu	The Way of Buddhist Meditation	V	93
Nāṇamoli Thera	tr. Mūlapariyāya Sutta	V	1
Olson, Carl	The Lotus as a Symbol in the Pāli Tradition	V	27
Perera, L. P. N.	An Analysis of the Sela Sutta of the Sutta Nipāta	IV	66

	Vol.	Page
Perera, L. P. N. and P. Wimalawamsa Peiris, Aloysius	I	3
Saddhātissa, H. Sharma, Arvind Sharma, Arvind	IV	5
Webb, Russell Webb, Russell	IV	25
"	IV	16
"	III	114
"	III	20
"	III	35
"	IV	86
"	II	162
"	III	146
"	II	114
"	III	84
"	V	39
"	IV	28
"	I	169
"	V	89
Wimalawamsa, P. and L. P. N. Perera	I	3

Book Reviews

Analytical Study of the Four Nikāyas, An	D. K. Barua	II	169
Brief History of Buddhist Studies in Europe and America	J. W. de Jong	II	64
Buddha Weg, Des (tr. of The Buddha's Way)	H. Saddhātissa (tr. S. Dornier)	II	66
Buddhist Concepts of Karma and Rebirth, The	Sunthorn Na-Rangsi	III	154
Buddhist Philosophy: a Historical Analysis	D. J. Kalupahana	II	66
Buddhist Studies in Honour of I. B. Horner	ed. L. S. Cousins et al	I	36
Buddhist Studies in Honour of Walpola Rāhula	ed. S. Balasuriya et al	V	97
Buddhistiska ballade och larodikt (tr. of Sutta Nipāta)	tr. Rune Johansson	II	67
Chronicle of Buddhas, The (tr. of Buddhavaṃsa)	tr. I. B. Horner	I	37
Clarifier of the Sweet Meaning, The (tr. of Madhurattavāṇī)	tr. I. B. Horner	IV	31
Companion to Middle Indo-Aryan Literature, A	S. C. Banerji	II	171
Critical Study of the Mahāvastu, A Cuore della Meditazione Buddhista, II (tr. of The Heart of Buddhist Meditation)	Telwatte Rāhula Nyānaponika Thera (tr. N. Ilari)	IV	98
Dasabodhisattuppattikathā, text and tr. Birth Stories of the Ten Bodhisattas	H. Saddhātissa	I	42
Dasavatthupakaraṇa, Le (text and tr.)	J. Ver Eecke	IV	34
Dhamma—Western Academic and Sinhalese Buddhist Interpretations	John Ross Carter	IV	94
Dictionary of Buddhism: Sutta- Nipāta	Sathaborn Malila	IV	99

		Vol.	Page
Dictionary of Early Buddhist Monastic Terms	C. S. Upasak	II	65
Dictionary of Oriental Literatures II	ed. D. Zhavittel et al	I	46
Discourse on the All-embracing Net of Views: the Brahmajāla Sutta and its Commentaries, The	tr. Bhikkhu Bodhi	IV	90
Dynamic Psychology of Early Buddhism, The	Rune Johansson	IV	92
Faith and Knowledge in Early Buddhism	Jan T. Ergardt	II	124
Geistes Gleichmass, Des (Nyānaponika Hon. Vol.)		I	181
Guide to Conditional Relations I	U. Nārada	IV	93
Individual and Society in Buddhism	W. G. Weeraratne	III	155
Introduction to Buddhist Psychology, A	P. de Silva	V	42
Leer van Boeddha, De (tr. of The Buddha's Way)	H. Saddhātissa (tr. B. Sinkeler and E. Molhuysen)	II	123
Life of the Buddha, The	tr. Nānamoli Thera	I	41
Malalasekera Commemoration Volume	ed. O. H. de A. Wijesekera	II	64
Meditaciōn (Segūn la mās antigua tradiciōn budista), La	L. M. Sandoz	V	101
Nārada Felicitation Volume	ed. Piyadassi Thera	V	47
Nyānatiloka Centenary Volume	ed. Nyānaponika Thera	III	88
Ornament of Buddha-Virtues, The (tr. of Bududurāṅkārāya)	tr. S. D. A. Weerasinghe	IV	35
Pali Buddhist Texts explained to the Beginner	Rune Johansson	(I II)	123 168
Pāli Language, The	T. Y. Elizarenkova and V. N. Toporov	II	65
Perfect Generosity of Prince Vessantara (tr. of Vessantara Jātaka)	Margaret Cone and R. F. Gombrich	III	90
Serenity and Insight according to the Pali Canon	Kheminda Thera	V	93
Stories of the Mansions (tr. of Vimānavatthu) and Stories of the Departed (tr. of Petavatthu)	tr. I. B. Horner and H. S. Gehman	I	37
Studies in Pali and Buddhism	ed. A. K. Narain	V	46
Tales and Teachings of the Buddha	J. Garrett Jones	V	44
Ten Jātaka Stories, ed. and tr.	I. B. Horner	I	37
Thinker's Note Book, A	Nānamoli Thera	I	44
Vers de la Doctrine, Les (tr. of Dhammapada)	tr. André Chedel	IV	96
Wisdom of the Early Buddhists, The	Geoffrey Parrinder	II	123
Zen and the Taming of the Bull	Walpola Rāhula	IV	36

News and Notes

I	48, 182
II	125
III	39, 92
IV	46, 100

Obituaries

Alsdorf, Ludwig	III	37
Godakumbura, C. E.	II	63
Kashyap, Jagdish	I	122